2100 M899 4058

FIRST DRAFT COMMENTS WELCOME



WOMEN, GENDER AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT; CHALLENGES FOR THE 1990S

by

Caroline O. N. Moser Urban Development Division World Bank Washington DC



Paper prepared for Final Workshop of
Ford Foundation Research Project on
'Urban Research in the Developing World: Towards an Agenda for the
1990s

Cairo, 14-18th February, 1993

laste : manifer de la resonatio certaire de laste : 1. De no 10 - manifer de la resonation de la resonation

FIRST DRAFT

WOMEN, GENDER AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT; CHALLENGES FOR THE 1990S¹

by Caroline O.N.Moser

PART ONE

INTRODUCTION

Why do Third World urban women and the gendered aspects of urban development form a separate urban research agenda? Surely they should be integrated into the existing agendas? In providing a review of the changing agenda of research on women, gender and urban development over the past three decades, this paper examines the case for a separate research agenda. In so doing it clarifies why urban gender issues have remained a marginal concern, and identifies their critical importance for current agendas in the 1990s, in which 'women's voices must enter the definition of development and the making of policy choices' (Sen and Grown, 1987, 82).

The definition of any research agenda is a complex process. Thus the manner in which urban agendas have been defined over the past decades has had important implications for gender issues. As research paradigms increase or decline in importance, this changes the interrelationship between disciplines, methodologies and policies, as well as between different political agendas. At the outset of such a review, a useful distinction can be made between gender-blind research, women and development (WID) research and gender and development (GAD) research. These three different approaches to research on women in the developing world have had a critical influence on the research agenda on women, gender and urban development. Since they raise a number of critical issues that run through the review, it is useful to distinguish them in slightly more detail.

Gender-blind research is based on the androcentric assumption that 'male is the norm'. Such a 'masculinist' mode of construction commonly results in a failure to recognize the gendered construction of knowledge and the implications this has for defining research issues, identifying problems and proposing appropriate policy responses. This way of viewing the world that assumes as 'natural' what in reality is the outcome of unequal distribution of power between social groups, has important research implications. Although 'women's issues' have been on the agenda of international agencies, national governments and grassroots groups for more than two decades, aside from the work of a small number of groups of committed practitioners, feminist academics and Third World women themselves, the tendency has been through genderblind research to ignore, misunderstand or even trivialize such issues. Therefore this review examines the extent to which this has also been the case with research on women, gender and urbanization.

ng

It was the politicization of women issues in the Third World, that occurred particularly during the United Nations Development Decade for Women (1975-1985) which resulted in the development of first WID and then GAD as new research and policy approaches in their own right.² The term 'WID' was first coined in the early 1970s in the USA by a group of mainly female professionals and researchers, concerned with the increasing evidence that Third World development projects were negatively affecting women. It recognizes that women are active participants in the development process, who through both their productive and reproductive roles provide a critical, if often unacknowledged contribution to economic growth. As an untapped resource, therefore, this approach argues that women must be 'brought into' the development process.

More recently recognition of the limitations of focusing on women in isolation has drawn attention to the need to look at GAD. Underlying this fundamental shift from 'women' to 'gender' is the concern to look less at women's problems as perceived of in terms of their sex, in other words their biological differences with men, and more in terms of their gender, in other words the social relations between men and women, in which women have been systematically subordinated (Moser, 1993,4).³

WID research tends to focus on women as a separate research category in their own right, to identify the issues important to women and to provide solution to assist them better participate in development processes. In contrast, the emphasis of GAD research is on the gender relations between men and women, the specific manner in which these are temporally and spatially constructed, and the ways within such asymmetrical relationships women are subordinated to men, with less access to or control over resources. Solutions are less focused on women in isolation but on the means by which the balance in such asymmetrical relations might be shifted or changed.

In this review, two gender planning tools useful in analysis are also introduced. First gender roles identification, which recognizes that within most Third World low-income households women have a triple role as reproducers, producers and community managers. Second, the WID/GAD policy matrix, which classifies policy approaches to women in development and distinguishes between welfare, equity, anti-poverty, efficiency and empowerment.

Despite the conceptual distinctions between the WID and GAD research approaches, both have been largely identified as specialist concerns. They, therefore, share a number of common characteristics that will be examined in this review. It is women themselves who conduct the vast majority of such research. At the same time, their identification with other women and their common experiences often leads to a conflation of personal and professional arenas. Not only do few men treat gender seriously in research, but also so do few women. Indeed to be taken seriously at all as professionals many women ensure that they do not focus on women's issues. In most

research and operational contexts the ability to succeed in what is essentially man's world does not sit easily with a preoccupation with the 'other', the subordinate group.

In urban research this has been exacerbated by the fact that the realm of the 'urban' has predominantly been defined in physical and spatial terms, linked to 'men's work, and dealing with such issues as transport, housing, land and infrastructure. These are associated with 'hard' edged disciplines such as economics, planning, engineering, architecture, public administration and geography. In contrast, the 'soft' social disciplines in which female researchers (but not issues of concern to women) predominate, such as sociology, demography and to a certain extent, anthropology, cover issues such as health, education and the family which are more commonly dealt with as separate national level sectoral concerns.

Finally, it is important to distinguish between urban specific research, and research that includes women living in urban areas. While there is a body of work concerned to address the intersection of women/gender and the urban, there are far more studies which do so incidentally. This is because the object of concern, either theoretical (eg. the division of labour) or empirical (eg. factory or office block), happens to be 'located' in an urban place. In countries where the bulk of the population live in urban areas, gender issues, by default, become urban issues. However, the fact that social, economic and environmental processes take place IN urban areas does not automatically transform them into issues OF the urban. Neither should the urban arena be seen merely as a backcloth against which processes are played out; the form and structure of cities has an impact on their manifestation. In other words, the city is not a backdrop upon which processes operate; the geographical context affects, and is affected by, these processes.

Research on women, gender and urban development has not occurred in isolation. A clear relationship exists between macro-economic development models and theoretical development paradigms, approaches to women and development, and urban research on women. Part Two, the bulk of the review is divided into four sections. These coincide with four distinct 'periods' dominated by a particular theoretical and policy development model. It is important, however, to recognize that theoretical models and policy approaches do not always coincide. One of the biggest tensions identified is the manner in which conflicts between them result in very different research agendas. The issue as to who, ultimately, sets the research agenda, is addressed in Part Three which focuses on the institutional, organizational and financial issues of research on gender, women and urban development. Part Four concludes the review by identifying current challenges in the 1990s.

PART TWO

CHANGING THEMES IN RESEARCH ON WOMEN, GENDER AND DEVELOPMENT 1960S - 1990S

Part Two examines four clearly identified 'periods' of Third World urban development, dominated by a particular theoretical and policy development model. In each case these are 'periods' where particular issues predominated. In some cases they have continued to be important research agendas in subsequent periods, while in other cases they have ceased to be so. The identification of such specific periods as a post-hoc exercise means that this review is written from the position of an outsider, and one that is both static and partial. Its purpose, nevertheless, is to provide a systematic analytical framework within which to identify shifts and changes in research agendas.

A schematic presentation such as this, however, necessitates a level of generalization that does not always do justice to developments in specific countries, or to particular topics of analysis. For example, not all countries exhibited all four stages in succession, with very uneven geographical coverage of issues. Therefore, although issues are discussed in the period in which they first came to light some have continued to be of interest in subsequent periods, although often with a different emphasis, or in conjunction with other topics. These links will be emphasized throughout the discussion.

One of the problems already recognized in this urban research project has been the limited distribution of research results outside the country of origin (Centre for Urban and Community Studies, 1992). Although this is a global review, it has been necessary to rely on the sources available. A consequent bias in terms of both the areas of research specialization, and sources published internationally in English, is acknowledged as a severe limitation. The intention of this review, therefore, is no more than to provide a starting point for local researchers on gender and urban development issues to contribute their own perspectives on these issues, and thereby participate fully in the development of future local level research agendas.

A. MODERNIZATION AND THE GROWTH OF CITIES (1950s - 1960s)

The conceptualization of development as a process of modernization arose in the 1950s and 1960s. The 'accelerated growth model' which dominated development planning for the first two decades after the Second World War aimed to increase overall national economic growth through a policy of urban based industrialization. Redistribution of resources throughout society was designed to be effected through the 'filter down' effect. In this sense the economy was conceived as a duality of 'traditional'

and 'modern' sectors. As the name modernization suggests one of its dominant concerns was to replace traditional with modern values, with the associated assumption that the rural area or village was the place of tradition whereas the town or city was the place of modernity.

Migrant 'Assimilation'

Social aspects of rapid urbanization which included such problems as squatter settlements, poverty and unemployment, were seen as temporary pressures which would pass with time. In the process of 'modernization' migrant workers from rural areas would gradually become absorbed into the city. With increased participation in the urban structure and increased assimilation of urban norms their would shift from their marginal position towards integration, moving from peripheral occupations in the 'exaggerated' tertiary sector to industrial sector wage employment. (Moser, 1978, 1042-3)

The processes of modernization that received attention at the level of urban research, therefore, were patterns and processes of urban growth, the debates over optimal city size and the role of primate cities, demographic issues related to urbanization, rural-urban migration and inequalities, and the issue of marginality. Research in this period was largely conducted by geographers, anthropologists and demographers.

Most research on the issues identified above was not 'peopled' at all, but concerned with the broad measurement of spatial and demographic trends. An important exception to this was the intense research on the issue of rural-urban migration and the problems of urban 'integration' and 'assimilation', undertaken mainly by anthropologists. Globally, rural gender divisions of labour determined the gendering of migration patterns. In African and Asian cities where such patterns were predominantly male, women were rarely included in the analysis, with references made either generally to 'people' or specifically to men. Where women were the subject of analysis, generally they were incorporated as static variables and if identified at all it was in their reproductive role.

There is an interesting silence on women, for instance, in the early definitive work of anthropologists of the Manchester School of Urban Anthropology such as Gluckman (1958), Epstein (1958), and Mitchell (1956) undertaken in urban sub-Saharan Africa. Thus in the debate about social change, Gluckman's famous comment 'a townsman is a townsman, a tribesman a tribesman' (1958) referred specifically to men who migrated to the Copperbelt urban mining communities. Similarly, in his study of the differing experiences of 'urbanization' between school and red Xhosa in East London, South Africa, entitled *Townsmen or Tribesmen*, Philip Mayer referred throughout to the migrant as 'he'.

At the end of this study of 'Men of Two Worlds' (1963,1) however, were two separate chapters on 'Girls and Women in Town' in which it was confusingly revealed that in reality, 'the flow of country-born women into East London exceeds (if anything) that of men' (1963,233). Fascinating details emerged concerning the migration motives for girls, unmarried women and widows who used East London as a 'semi-permanent escape', a place 'to be independent' or 'free' from the 'subjection' experienced in the 'rural social system' (1963,234). For Mayer the important point was that the majority were 'unattached women'. Since relatively few men male migrants could or did bring their wives with them to town, his primary focus was on the sexual servicing such women provided. Although the economic independence of such women was acknowledged, the main preoccupation was with the issue of 'immorality in towns' - the fact that the breakdown of rural concepts of community and family in the urban context also resulted in a breakdown in control over female sexuality (Meyer, 1963,252).

The Culture of Poverty

A similar romanticism about rural communities and 'the folk-urban continuum' and a preoccupation with the breakdown of social order and the family in towns, and its implications for female promiscuity was reflected in the formative work of Oscar Lewis (1959, 1961, 1966). Anthropological work on poor families in Mexico City and San Juan, Puerto Rico lead him to hypothesize that it was the poor's separate 'subculture' which, with its self-perpetuating mechanisms for transmission to succeeding generations, made them unable to escape their poverty. By the late 1960s Lewis's work on urban marginality and his concept of the 'culture of poverty' was set to influence decades of anti-poverty policy-makers in the USA and UK as much as in Latin America. Although his fieldwork provided important insights into the lives of poor urban women, there was a moralistic voyeurism, rather than economic determinism, particularly in his study of women prostitutes in *La Vida* (1971).

In his analytical conceptualization of seventy 'traits' of the culture of poverty, the social and psychological characteristics relevant to women related primarily to their reproductive role, and to their sexuality and passivity. These included:

'wife beating, early initiation into sex, free unions or consensual marriages, a relatively high incidence of the abandonment of mothers and children, a trend towards mother-centered families ...(and above all)...a belief in male superiority which reaches its crystallization in <u>machismo</u> or the cult of masculinity, a corresponding martyr complex among women, and finally, high tolerance for psychological pathology of all sorts'(Lewis, 1961, xxvii).⁸

It is interesting to note that in the West African context Kenneth Little's influential writings in women and urbanization processes also contributed to the stereotype image of female migrants as actual or potential prostitutes. (See Little, 1965,

1973). This view has been empirically disputed by, for instance, Sudarkasa (1970) and Sanjek (1976).

Women in 'Male' Towns

It was Ester Boserup's <u>rural</u> research showing that women were often the predominant 'invisible' contributors to the basic agricultural productivity of their communities, that first created a broad awareness of the role of women in Third World development among academics and policy-makers - with a critical impact on the development of WID policy. Her <u>urban</u> work is far less known and had far less policy impact, despite the fact that two thirds of her seminal book *Women's Role in Economic Development* focuses on urban areas, defined by Boserup as 'Women in a Men's World'. She identified 'male towns' in Africa and Asia as those where colonial labour recruitment practices meant that men outnumbered women. Even where numbers were equal, towns were still 'male' if, as in 'Arab countries, India and Pakistan'

'the economic life of the town and all outdoor activities are taken care of by men, while women live in seclusion within the family dwelling' (1970,86).

Boserup distinguished between these, and a third type of town, common in West Africa, and defined as 'semi-male', where 'streets and market places are dominated by women, since most of the retail trade is in female hands' (1970,87). Boserup concluded that the increasing preference for male workers occurring with accelerated industrialization meant that women were increasingly being 'left behind' in traditional activities during urbanization processes. As in rural areas, her particular contribution was to highlight women's productive income earning work and labour participation rates, detailing the distinct and differing gender divisions of labour in different regions of the world. However, in so doing she failed to recognize women's reproductive work as work, allowing her to conclude, for instance, that in most Arab countries no more than some 5% of women carry on any economic activity. 'The remaining 95% of adult women do little more than cooking the daily meals and taking care of children' (1970,187).

Women 'Who Wait' and Women Who Migrate

These regional differences in migration patterns between men and women by the late 1960s and early 1970s resulted in very different research foci. In Southern Africa rural 'Women Who Wait' (Wellesley Editorial Committee, 1977) was the issue (see for instance Mueller (1977); Sibisi (1977); Gordon (1981)); in West Africa the perceived 'power and independence' of market women traders and 'ability' to 'hold her own' was highlighted, (see for instance Little (1965); Lloyd (1969); Pons (1969) and Sudarkasa (1970); while in Latin America the cityward migration of female domestic servants and their 'adaptation' to urban life was perceived to be a channel of upward mobility. (See

Line

Jelin (1977); Rubo, (1975); Smith (1973). As Dandeker/Kolenda's (1986) historical account between 1942-1982 of 'Men to Bombay: Women at Home' illustrated, these are long term historically processes; indeed Gugler's much later 1989 West African study of 'women on the farm no more', showed the way that migration patterns have changed in many regions of the world since the 1970s.

It is also important to note that the gender-specific aspects of 'adaptation' to urban life have remained a serious research preoccupation, illustrated by studies in context as diverse as Taiwan (Hsieh, 1982), Malaysia (Armstrong, 1987) and the Cameroons (Keirn, 1975). In the Asian context, for instance, a recent collection of articles edited by Fawcett, Khoo and Smith, (1884) recognized that 'until recently women were virtually invisible in migration processes, because of the assumption that most were merely passive movers who followed the household head' (1984,4). The focus on female migration and 'adaptation' was justified in terms in terms of its importance in detecting changes in the family as an institution, as well as 'sex-specific' cultural constraints on migration. For instance, a number of studies in Middle Eastern countries such Saudi Arabia (Altorki, 1977), Morocco (Maher, 1974) and Iran (Rudolph-Touba) examined then way in which urbanization changes women status within the family.

B. REDISTRIBUTION WITH GROWTH IN CITIES: BASIC NEEDS (1970s - Early 1980s)

By the late 1960s the limitations of a modernization model of development were recognized. Accelerated growth strategies based on maximizing GNP were not leading to the expected levels of development nor of income redistribution, while at the same time problems of poverty and unemployment were increasing. At the political level, particularly in Latin America, the paradigm of modernization was replaced by a more radical theorization of development processes, that of dependency theory. In this the 'underdevelopment' of Third World societies was a necessary requisite of development in the West. (See for instance Frank (1966); Laclau (1971); Cardoso (1972).¹⁰

Marginalization, Shantytowns and Squatter Settlements

In the urban context the failure of 'trickle down' resulted in an increasing preoccupation with poverty and unemployment, and the clarification that economic growth per se would not lead to any fundamental redistribution of resources. The social, economic, spatial and political marginalization (as against marginality) of low-income populations in urban areas was a consequence of exclusion, lack of access and exploitation, rather than a lack of 'integration'. The problem of poverty was not a question of individual 'cultural' traits, but the consequence of structural economic transformations, determined both by national and international factors, linked to issues of class and political institutions (Quijano (1970), Moser, (1977); Moser and

Satterthwaite (1985). Consequently, urban issues were no longer simply social problems but also political concerns.

If the predominant unit of urban research in the 1960s was the individual (for the measurement of rural-urban demographic trends), or the family (linked to policy preoccupations with its moral decline in urban areas), in the 1970s this was augmented by the household (which often contained extended family), and a preoccupation concerning its economic viability. Here the 'slum' and 'shanty studies' of anthropologists and sociologists were important in identifying the role of social, economic and political networks of reciprocal exchange as critical mechanisms for survival. Most of this research was gender blind, or at best gender neutral, linked to the consensus view of marriage as comprising equal but different partners. As the following table shows, an interesting indicator of the limited focus on women in their own right is the paucity of reference to 'women' in the subject index of a number of 'classic' Latin American slum studies of this period. It is important to mention that all these researchers were First Worlders although not necessarily men; Perlman, Eckstein and Peattie are all women, some of whom have since worked on gender issues (see for instance, Peattie (198?).

Name	Publication Date	City	References to Women in Subject Index
Collier	1976	Lima	0
Cornelius	1975	Mexico City	0
Peattie	1970	Ciudad Guayana	0
Eckstein	1977	Mexico City	0
Roberts	1973	Guatemala City	?
Perlman	1976	Rio de Janeiro	?

In contrast, it is important to recognize the work of other women anthropologists who during the same period, attempted to understand the situation of urban women. These included Wikan (1976) in Cairo; Safa (1976) in San Juan; Schuster (1979) in Lusaka; Bujra (1976) in Nairobi; Mernissi (1975) in Morocco, and Bohman in Cali, to mention a few. Lomnitz (1977) in her study of *Networks and Marginality* in a Mexico City shantytown', shows some of the inherent contradictions in discussing the role of slum women. Writing about 'husbands' and 'wives', she describes a situation of culturally prescribed 'sex roles' in which there is:

'a strict partition of marital roles.. (with a) relatively low-emotional content of husband-wife relations...as for the female role its traditional hallmark is a capacity for suffering.....shantytown women tend to develop strong, resilient

personalities that eventually make then pillars of strength within their social groups. Men, on the other hand, are seen as emotionally immature, overgrown children...(1975,94).

Politicization of urban problems by the mid-1970s also resulted in an increasing focus on the role of the local state in the process of urbanization, not only as the provider of infrastructure for industrial development, but also for the generation of employment, and supply of items of 'collective consumption' i.e. goods and services necessary for the reproduction of the labour force. In this focus on strategies to eradicate poverty through the satisfaction of basic needs, two multilateral agencies, in particular, the International Labour Organization and the World Bank, played a critical role in determining the emerging urban policy research agenda.

The Informal Sector and Basic Needs

The ILO's Employment Policy Convention (No. 122) committed governments to adopt 'active full-employment policies' with the World Employment Programme in 1969 launching more than a decade of policy oriented research on the **informal sector** indeed ongoing until today. Focus on the informal sector developed as studies by the ILO or associated consultants shifted from a preoccupation with unemployment to an emphasis on employment, with the 'working poor' defined as the most important target group - the majority of whom were identified as finding work or remuneration in small scale activities or enterprises in the so-called the informal sector - the term itself deriving originally from the work of an urban anthropologist, Keith Hart, in Accra. The focus of informal sector studies were urban, with the level quickly moving from country to city, and finally to income-generating sectors within cities. An early publication, *Casual Work and Poverty in Third World Cities*, edited by Bromley and Gerry (1979) included studies of enterprises as diverse as garbage recyclers, bottle buyers, petty trading, begging, and small-scale manufacturing in cities such as Nairobi, Chandigarh, Dakar, Manila, Cali, and San Cristobal las Casas.

Throughout the 1970s most informal sector research was at worst gender blind, or at best underenumerated women.¹³ Indeed as late as 1981, Sethuraman, Head of the Informal Sector research programme at the ILO, felt confident enough to able to conclude that in a nine city study in African, Asian and Latin American cities:

'Female participation in the informal sector *seems* surprisingly low.... Though in some cases female participation seems to be underestimated owing to sample design, dominance of males in the informal sector is in general noticeable in Africa, Asia and Latin America' (1981,190: emphasis added).

The fact that ILO surveys were enterprise based, and biased towards larger scale enterprises in the <u>productive</u> sector, meant that they 'missed' the majority of women who

clustered in outwork, subcontracting and disguised wage work, such as the unrecognized work of wives in household enterprises. Equally they ignored the smaller one-person 'enterprises' in the <u>service</u> and <u>distributive</u> sectors which in many contexts are predominated by women (Moser, 1984).

Complementing the ILOs research on urban poverty reduction, was the development of the basic needs concept, defined as an approach 'which gives priority to meeting the basic needs of all people' (Stewart, 1985,1). Developed primarily as a project level strategy for poverty alleviation its focus was cross-sectoral terms to include not only such 'social' infrastructure as schools, medical centers and housing, but also 'economic' infrastructure such as roads, sanitation and water.

Basic Needs was essentially the invention of the 'international development community'. Prominent in its early endorsement was Robert McNamara who, in 1972, announced the official shift of the World Bank from a preoccupation with economic growth to a broader concern to eradicate absolute poverty and promote 'Redistribution with Growth' (Streeten et al, 1981). At the project level, widespread World Bank intervention occurred particularly in the housing and infrastructure sectors, through 'site and service' and squatter 'upgrading' projects. Basic needs projects focused on the household as the unit both of analysis and for intervention, and as such did not disaggregate within it. While women were clearly seen as beneficiaries of such infrastructure as water and sanitation, they were identified most commonly in their reproductive role, with needs identified entirely at the household level.

Like the informal sector, basic needs generated an important urban research agenda. This related not only to basic needs as a concept. 14 but also to its sectoral implications. In cities, by far the most extensive, was the empirical research on land and housing. This derived out of self-help housing debates between above all, Turner (1970, 1976) and Burgess (1978, 1987, 1992) - a debate which has continued into the 1990s. 15 Housing studies have proliferated in most important cities of the world. Amongst other things these highlighted household level housing needs, in cities such as Ankara (Payne, 1982), Bogota, (Gilbert, 19), Mexico City (Connolly, 1982). They critically evaluated the failure or success of World Bank housing solutions such as FUNDASAL in El Salvador (Harth Deneke and Silva, 1978); (Bamberger and Deneke, 1984), the Kampong Improvement Programme in Jakarta and Surabaya (Silas, 1984) and the Chawama upgrading project in Lusaka (Sanyal et al, 1981). They identified the importance of community participation in self-help solutions in projects such as the Orangi Pilot Project and Baldia Soak Pit, Karachi (Hasan, 1985, 1986); (Bakhtiari, 1984), Villa el Salvador, Lima (Skinner, 1983); Hyderabad (Cousins, 1977 and Cousins and Goyder, 1986) and Lusaka (Rakodi, 1983).

Research on low-income urban housing issues was undertaken mainly by architects and geographers, most of whom were men. The household or family was the

unit of analysis. Thus research into eligibility criteria for housing projects occurred at the family level, with reference to income groups based on the income of the male breadwinner. In assuming the male headed nuclear family to be the 'normal' household structure, it obviously excluded women headed households. While research on community participation made the distinction between local leaders, neighbourhood organizations and political parties, as the three community level groups involved in community participation, further analytical disaggregation was less common.

Research on housing <u>projects</u> nevertheless also showed that 'without the women the project would never have worked'. In the Baldia Soak Pit Project, Karachi, for instance, a low-income community based project for soak pits and double pit latrines was based on community acceptance and participation in the construction of the soak pits. Documenting it's success, Chauhen (1983) described how:

'The community organizer was keen to organize the community through the women, but points out that initially the project staff were liaising only with the male heads of each household. When men went out to work they would leave their wives instructions regarding the construction of pits. As the work progressed the women got more involved. This happened naturally because it was the women who had to arrange for the digging, buy the necessary equipment and supervise the construction... The men did not feel that the women's work on the latrines was affecting their status. The community organizer feels that this has in fact made the women more liberated than before'. (1983,42).

However, despite empirical research results such as this, gender was not introduced as an analytical category, and the significant role that women played in community participation rarely mentioned in policy level research.¹⁶

The UN Decade for Women and Urban Research

By the 1970s, the influence of both the second wave feminism of the late 1960s, and the establishment of the United Nation's Decade for Women, 1975-1985, resulted in a parallel research agenda. This was research on both WID and GAD, undertaken predominantly by women, seen as a separate areas of analysis and virtually never incorporated into other studies of power relations in the development process. For the last twenty years, therefore, there have essentially been three separate urban research agendas; gender blind, WID and GAD focused. In the rest of this review, greater emphasis is given to the latter two.

Women, the Informal Sector and Petty Commodity Production

It was their role as producers, rather than their reproductive role within the family, that women researchers in the 1970s turned, in disciplines which included

anthropology, geography, sociology and economics. In the urban context it was obvious that initially the objective of much of this research was to 'disprove' the ILO thesis that few women were in the informal sector, and to recommend that future work on the sector should disaggregate data to include age, gender and skill. A proliferation of studies soon showed globally the critical importance of the informal sector as a source of income for women, not only in female-headed households but secondary income earners. Within a WID framework definitive studies such as Banerjee (1981) on Calcutta; Savara (1981) on Madras; Arispe on Mexico City (1977); Schmink (1982) and Merrick (1976) on Bela Horizone; Nelson (1979) and Bujra (1986) on Nairobi; Hansen (1980) on Lusaka; Wachtel (1975) on Nakuru; and Jellenick (1978) on Jakarta, to mention just a few, documented and measured the high level of female informal sector participation and described the income generating activities in which women were involved.

Once women researchers had 'proved' the presence of women in the informal sector, focus turned to the analysis of gender relations within the sector itself, in other words a shift towards a GAD framework, with research on this continuing for the next decade. One of the earliest such analyses of the informal sector, undertaken in Lima by Scott, concluded:

'Insofar as there is segmentation in the manual labour market, the most significant dichotomy is not between small- and large-scale enterprises, but between men and women's jobs. Within both sectors men tend to have greater access to skill and capital and hence to better income levels and mobility chances than women. The stereotyped image of employment in the informal sector is actually a more accurate description of women's jobs' (1981).¹⁷

Research on small scale 'petty commodity production' within the informal sector showed it as both dependent and involutionary in nature, with its relationship to large scale formal sector production exploitative in terms of issues such as access to credit, markets and raw materials (Moser 1978, 1984; Schmidt 1982). However, for women working in this sector, exploitation by the formal sector was not the only constraint confronted. Research showed not only that women clustered in the smallest scale, least profitable areas of the formal sector but also that where there was intense competition within the sector, gender was frequently used as an essential element in the divisions of labour, forcing women into less lucrative areas. Competition among cooked food sellers in Guayaquil, for instance, showed that:

'What emerges is the use of space defined in gender terms, and particularly obvious in the case of mobile selling where men, assisted by an ideology of male dominance, try to exclude women from the most profitable areas of selling by associating 'going in the street' with prostitution. (Moser, 1981,28).

In this example of the process of masculization of a traditional women's work, cooked food selling, men were in fact totally reliable on the household enterprise in order to cook the goods they sold in the market. The same theme was explored later in two edited volumes on women in home-based production in India. Their titles, Invisible Hands (Meneffe Singh and Kelles-Viitanen, 1987) and Tyranny of the Household (Jain and Banerjee, 1985) both conveyed the authors' assessment of gender relations in household enterprises where men recruited their wives to work unpaid in tasks such as sewing, weaving or cooking. During the late 1970s and early 1980s a number of studies highlighted other informal sector constraints encountered by women in their gendered role. For instance, where women themselves controlled enterprises, unequal access to credit, because of lack of collateral, meant they were often unable to expand their enterprises unless non-traditional forms of credit were available to them (Bruce, 1980; IWTC, 1985); lack of control over savings, highlighted in the important work of SEWA (the Self-Employed Women's Association) in Ahmedabad also prevented enterprise expansion (Sebsted, 1982; Karl, 1983); lack of mobility due to child care responsibilities was another constraint encountered by women in such cities as Naples (Goddard, 1981), and Queretero (Chant, 1987), while in societies where women were secluded, such as in Kano, Nigeria, women trader's used children as intermediaries (Simi Afonja, 1981).

Finally it is important to mention the reappraisal of prostitution and its hypothesized contribution to 'immorality in towns' from a feminist perspective, which occurred during the 1970s, particularly in African cities. Researchers such as Bujra (1975), Dirasse (1978) and Nelson (1978) argued that given the numerical dominance of men in towns and the scarcity of legal work, prostitution, along with beer brewing, represented a rational economic choice. Prostitutes frequently supported segments of their rural kin, while sending their children home to be raised there (White, 1983), they formed professional associations, and warned each other of police raids (Nelson, 1978). Infact 'work paid off for prostitutes and brewers: in the rigidly segregated townships of colonized East and South Africa, between 20 and 50% of African property owners were single adult women' (White, 1984,65).

C. THE MANAGEMENT OF CITIES (Early - Mid 1980s)

The 1980s were dominated by the global debt crisis and recession, and the political resurgence of the new right in many parts of the world. Both had important implications for urbanization processes, as well as for urban research. While the decade divides, roughly, into two periods, it is recognized that the cut-off point is somewhat arbitrary.

The early and mid 1980s were dominated by a shift in multilateral and government urban development policy, away from 'top down' state provision of basic

needs to the improved management of cities, and the development of 'enabling strategies' to assist wherever possible the 'bottom up' provision of such services. Consequently donor and state commissioned research focused at the urban level on such issues as the role of local and municipal government and urban public finance, and was undertaken mainly by economists, public administration specialists, statisticians and geographers.

Castells and Urban Social Movements

In contrast to commissioned research, for many academic researchers, particularly in Latin America, it was the 'crisis of collective consumption' and the development of urban social movements which was a primary concern. Manuel Castells, a principal protagonist in this debate, argued that this was 'inherent in the disjunction between profit and need, exchange value and use value, production and consumption in the urban system' (Castells, 1977). Here the preoccupation was whether popular struggles over inadequate state provision of basic needs provided the basis for the development of urban social movements in which broad class alliances were linked together in political struggle not at the point of production as was traditionally the case, but at the point of residence. The fact that residential level struggles were seen as inherently weaker than those around production issues was said to relate to the fact that issues of collective consumption did not necessarily coincide with class interests or antagonisms (see Borja, 1981; Castells, 1977, 1982, 1983; Fals Borda, 1985; Saunders, 1984; Slater, 1985).

The literature on urban social movements mentioned women descriptively in passing. Castells (1983) in his extensive historical review, *The City and the Grass Roots*, recognized the critical role women played in urban struggles, mobilizing on behalf of their 'families' needs' in the context of urban-based class and power struggles. He provided detailed examples from a diversity of historical contexts, such as the 1871 Paris Commune, the 1915 Glasgow Rent Strike and the 1922 Movimiento Inquilinario in Veracruz, Mexico, as well as contemporary examples such as popular organization in the Santiago squatter *campamentos* during the Allende government. On the basis that through consumption-based struggles women should develop an awareness of the nature of their gender based subordination, Castell's analyzed their participation in terms of feminist consciousness, and the emergence of the women's feminist movement which 'aims at overcoming the structural domination of one gender by the other' (1983,309). The relationships between the women's movement and urban social movements, however, was not hypothesized.

While governments were concerned with the better management of cities, researchers (mainly men) documented the complexities of mobilization at the point of residence, sometimes mentioning women but without reference to the gendered nature of such struggle, in cities as distinct as Buenos Aires (Ziccardi, 1977; Silva and Schuurman, 1989); Rio de Janiero (Valaderes, 1978); Vitorio (Brazil), (Banck and Doimo, 1989); Madras (de Wit, 1989) Karachi (van der Linden, 1989) Crossroads, Cape

Town (Cole, 1987¹⁹; Isaacs, 1989); and Tondo, Manila (Honculada,1985; Ruland, 1984). In such studies, the use of gender-neutral terms such as 'leaders' and 'organizers' without gender specification implicitly reinforced the dominant notions that men played these roles, while women were their supporters; with terms such as 'he', 'him' and 'men' reinforcing the impression that it was men and not women who were the main activists.²⁰

Women's Urban Struggle and Community Managing

This was complemented by a very different literature concerned to reconstruct and document the same urban protest but from a feminist perspective. It explicitly identified and analyzed women's actions, needs, and subjective meanings as an integral part of protest - on the basis that 'the actions and attitudes of men cannot be generalized to cover the entire population' (West and Blumberg, 1990,8). One important contribution to this was the component of women and social movements within the UNRISD Participation Research Project, a research project in both Asia and Latin America. The project's objective was to examine the organized efforts made by excluded social groups to increase their control over resources, decision making processes and the regulative institutions of society at large. The results of the Latin American studies on women in social movements, edited by Elizabeth Jelin in *Women and Social Change in Latin America*, contained urban case studies from Lima (Blondet, 1990) and Buenos Aires (Feijoo, 1990), while other studies from such cities as Guadalajara (Pardinas and Dieste, 1988), Lima (Andreas, 1985) provide additional examples from Latin America.

Feminist researchers were concerned to document the role of women, not only as participants in <u>struggle</u> over items of collective consumption, but also, and as an extension of this, the manner in which they were <u>managing</u> in cities. Acceptance of gender divisions of labour meant that women were managing the allocation, provisioning and maintenance of items of both household and community level consumption needs - the later identified as a 'natural' extension of their domestic work. (Moser, 1989a, 1993). In fact in an earlier work Castells (1978) had noted the state's reliance on the women's unpaid reproductive and community managing work in cities, when he stated:

'it is the subordinate role of women which enables the minimum 'maintenance' of its housing, transport and public facilities...because women guarantee unpaid transportation (movement of people and merchandise), because they repair their homes, because they make the meals when there are no canteens,... because they look after others children when there are no nurseries... if women who 'do nothing' ever stopped to do 'only that', the whole urban structure as we know it would become completely incapable of maintaining its functions.' (1978, 177-8)

Women, Basic Services and Housing

In different contexts the reality of urban low-income women's lives and their organization around different 'bread and butter' issues were documented. Amongst a diversity of examples these included health issues in Sao Paulo (ISIS, 1985; Machado, 1991), child care in Lima (Allyon Viana, 1982) water in Guayaquil (Moser, 1987) and Tegucigalpa (Resources for Action, 1982); waste recycling in Mexico (Schmink, 1984, 1989) and finally an extensive literature on the critical role played by women in collective construction in self-help housing in such cities as Guadelajara (Diaz, 1988), Panama (Girling, Lycette and Youssef, 1983) and Kingston, Jamaica (McLeod, 1989). In the case of one such project in Managua, for instance, Vance (1987) provided a fascinating case study of the conflicts that occurred between men and women, because of different perceptions of work. This was most extreme when men failed to take account of womens triple role, particularly in relation to reproduction, over the inevitable absences of women from building teams during late pregnancy (1987, 163).

One research initiative in particular deserves mentioning. This was the Population Councils' Women, Low-Income Households and Urban Services Project with research groups established in Jamaica, Mexico City and Peru (see Schmink, 1984, Schmink et al 1986). In the case of Lima this resulted in a working paper publication series by the same name continuing into the 1990s, covering such basic services as water, child care, and transportation (see, for example, Barrig and Fort, 1987).

Although most widely documented in Latin America, women's community level organization was also highlighted in cities in other areas of the world. Examples included the maintenance of community facilities in Colombo (Fernandez, 1987), village bus services in Kenya (Kneerim, 1989), and self-help housing in Lusaka (Rakodi, 1983, Schlyter, 1988) and Nairobi (Nimpuno-Pariente, 1987). In a number of sectors it was the constraint's women experienced due to gender-blind urban planning that required identification (see Moser, 1987a). A number of studies in the public transport sector illustrated this. For instance in Belo Horizonte, Brazil, assignment of routes meant women living in peripheral settlements had longer trips and changed transport more often than men (Schmink, 1982); in Lima lack of safeguards to physical attack or sexual harassment on public vehicles restricted women's use of all types of transport (Anderson and Panzio, 1986); in the village of Mraru in Kenya, women found that the infrequency and resultant overcrowding of buses to the nearest market town (Kneerim, 1980).²²

Extensive research in the housing sector revealed a wide diversity of constraints affecting women's access to housing and their living conditions.²³ Amongst those identified the following were significant; in Brazil eligibility criteria in a housing programme excluded women who headed households from access to housing projects by determining that 'the candidate should be the father of at least two children' (Machado, 1987,62); in a site and service project in Quito, Ecuador, although 30% of applicants

were women who headed households made up 30% of the applicants, 46% of these did not qualify for access because their incomes were too low. (Lycette and Jaramillo, 1984); in Tunis, isolation from public life for cultural reasons meant few women in a squatter settlement or core housing project had heard about shelter programmes in their city (Sorock et al, 1984); in a relocation settlement, Dashinpuri, on the outskirts of Delhi it was found that women were far more affected by the move. Increased distance from work resulted in a 275 decline in female employment, as against 5% fall for men (Singh, 1980); in Lusaka, new lay outs in settlement planning of the George upgrading project meant women were forced to work in more isolated conditions and were no longer able to leave children playing under the watchful eye of neighbours (Schlyter, 1984); in the Nairobi Dandora sites and services project, zoning legislation preventing the development of income-earning activities in residential areas particularly affected those women whose child care responsibilities meant they could not leave their homes (Nimpuno-Parente, 1987); failure to consult women about their housing needs resulted in insensitive house design in Tunis where Western designs provided insufficient inner courtyard space (Resources for Action, 1982a). Constraints such as these meant studies began to focus on women's housing needs in cities such as Tunis (Waltz,), Lahore (Shah, 1986), as well as the relationship between female headship and housing strategies, in for instance, Harare (Schlyter, 1989) and Gabarone (Larsson, 1989).

Household Headship and Intra-household Resource Allocation

During this period a number of other important research areas developed which were not urban specific, but were predominantly identified as urban phenomena. First, was the issue of household headship, challenged by Rogers (1980) as 'a figment of the statisticians imagination' and the recognition that the planning stereotype of nuclear families with male breadwinners and women homemakers no longer represented the reality for many low-income women in cities. This resulted in research on the household and the particular forms it took in the urban context. Of greatest importance was research on households headed by women, both to measure its magnitude and to identify the particular constraints experienced by such households. The most common type found was *de facto* women headed households, in which the male partner was absent, either temporarily (due to, for instance, migration or refugee status), or permanently, due to separation or death. In urban areas, especially in Latin America and parts of Africa the figure was calculated to be 50% or more (Buvinic and Youssef, 1978).

While country level definitions varied, making comparative studies less than useful, research showed this was more likely to be an urban than rural phenomenon, in for instance, Jamaica (Bolles, 1986), Morocco (Joekes, 1985), Kenya (Nelson, 1978), and Brazil (Merrick and Schmink, 1983) and Nicaragua (Vance, 1987). The most important debate concerned the extent to which such households were the 'poorest of the poor' - an important issue for targeted assistance. It became clear that this was not necessarily the case. In Southern Asia, for instance Huizer (1986) commented that they

are not an undifferentiated group, and 'many are not poor when compared to some male-headed households' (1986,7). Joekes (1985) reached a similar conclusion in the case of Morocco, while in many West African towns such as Abidjan, women positively resisted living with their partners for fear of being economically constrained (Etienne, 1983). Again in Queretero, Mexico, Chant (1985) found that women inside male headed household were often worse off than their counterparts in female headed households. Studies such as these challenged the conventional view of women who headed households as deviants, a product of male absence whose very composition trapped them in poverty. While for some this was the case, for many others it was a deliberate strategy of the part of women who did not wish to be forced to support an economically marginalized man. From a policy perspective such households could no longer be viewed homogeneously.

Other more recent Latin American research in both Santiago (Buvinic, 1992) and Guayaquil (Moser, forthcoming) showed an increasing number of single mothers, financially unable to live of their own, and 'hidden' in extended families. In fact, in many urban contexts research during the 1980s showed that the extended family had not disappeared with process of urbanization, as had previously been postulated. In some urban contexts such as in Hindu communities in India the extended family has always been important for reasons of economic, social and psychological support (Sharma, 1986; Caplan, 1985). In other contexts such as in West Africa it has been identified as a consequence of economic pressures. In Bo, one of the largest towns in Sierra Leone, for instance Peil and Sada (1984) found that the life cycle was a critical variable, with extended households more common when the household head was middle aged or elderly.

A second, complex, research area to appear on the agenda during this period was the issue of intrahousehold resource allocation. In fact early work was rural focused and highly theoretical, challenging the model of rural households as a joint utility function. (Evens, 1989; Sen, 1990). However it soon turned to the urban context (Dwyer and Bruce, 1988). Research in urban Zambia, for instance, focused on income allocation and marriage options (Munachonga, 1988); in Cairo it examined household budgeting and financial management (Hoodfar, 1988) and in Mexico City it examined intrahousehold patterns of money allocation and the 'renegotiation of the marital contract (Roldan, 1988).

Women in Urban Wage Employment

If the research on women's productive work focused primarily on the informal sector in the 1970s, in the 1980s many researchers prioritized formal sector labour market participation and the implications of changing global industrial processes for the restructuring for women's work. In such an extensive research field it is only possible to highlight a few issues here. One priority was to confront the problems of the underestimation of women's activities (Beneria, 1981) by more accurate measurements of female participation rates, and the identification of its characteristics, generally at

country level (Standing, 1976; Anker and Hein, 1986; Hopkins, 1983; Joekes, 1987). Others focused on female participation rates the urban level in, for instance, Nigeria (Lacey, 1986; Fadayomi, 1991), Tanzania (Shields, 1980), Malaysia (Eden, 1993), and Puerto Rico (Safa, 1986).

Underwriting this, was the theoretical debate concerning women's unequal place in the labour market - gender segregation and stratification theory and the 'female' marginalization thesis (Scott, 1986a, 1986b). Detailed case studies examined gender, pay and skills differentials, for instance, in the automobile industry in Brazil particularly during periods of job loss (Humphries, 1985; Hirata and Humphries, 1991), as well as the gendered effects of technological change in Brazilian firms (Saffioti, 1986). The relationship between education levels and gender inequality was another research topic in, for instance, China (Bauer,1992) and Bangalore, India (Shantha Mohan, 1989). A particular concern was the 'intersection of labour demand and household strategies' with studies in , for instance, Cairo (Ibrahim, 1982), Qwaqwa (Niehaus, 1988) and urban India. Here, Sharma's (1986) study of Shimla, examined the interrelationship between women's waged work and their contribution to the maintenance and management of household resources in different social classes, with a similar theme explored in Calcutta (Standing, 1991), as well as urban Kenya (Stichter, 1985) and India (Ramu, 1989).

Linked to this was research on the particular implications of the internationalization of capital and the restructuring of industrial production for women's waged work. Two process, in particular, were highlighted. First, the feminization, or 'female-led industrialization' of the industrial labour force in export zones, where production was relocated to avoid trade union or other regulations in Free Trade or Border Zones. Elson and Pearson (1981a, 1981b) identified how most frequently young single-women were recruited because of their so-called 'nimble fingers', when in reality they form the cheapest, most docile labour force best suited for tedious, repetitive, and monotonous work. A study of the clothing industry in Morocco (Joekes, 1982) showed how factory owners took advantage of lower female employment costs with matching, or even higher, levels of productivity, justified on the basis that women were 'working for lipstick' (Joekes, 1985). A similar justification was used in Hong Kong electronics factories, where the lower wages of young single-women were attributed to their secondary status in the labour market, which was itself identified because of their capacity to bear children (Lim, 1981; Lim, 1990). Amongst other important studies undertaken were, for instance, those of the Bangladesh garment industry (Kabeer, 1991), the relocation of international production in Singapore (Heyzer, 1988) and women workers in the Mexican boarder industry (Pearson, 1988; Fernandez-Kelly, 1980).

Complementary with this concern was the process of fractionalizing labour processes through sub-contracting and outwork, again to increase profits through lower factory costs and outwork wages. Banerjee's important study, *Women Workers in the Unorganized Sector*, described the employment patterns, wage levels, working conditions

and social background of 400 women workers in the unorganized sector of Calcutta, many of whom were employed as piece-rate workers at home. In the case of Mexico city Beneria and Roldan's study of women sub-contractors and contractual outworkers (1987) focused, in addition, on the 'analytical dualism' between gender and class.

It is important to mention that research on the informal sector did not disappear during the 1980s, but took different forms. In the Indian context, for instance, two very different studies were undertaken. The National Institute of Urban Affairs' five year study of women in the informal sector provided important findings as to the size of female participation (nearly 50% as against census figures of 8%), with the highest concentration in various types of trade and production, followed by piece-rate work and casual wage labour in construction (NIUA, 1991) complementary to this was *Shramshakti* (1988), the national level policy report of the National Commission on Self Employment Women and Women in the Informal Sector, chaired by Ela Bhatt the founder of SEWA.

In other contexts donor-funded action-oriented prescriptive research focused on the identification of constraints and opportunities for income-generating projects for women. Generally, small in scale, to be developed by NGOs, most frequently all-women in composition, they aimed to increase productivity in activities traditionally undertaken by women, rather than to introduce women to new areas of work. Buvinic (1986) for instance, highlighted the problems experienced by anti-poverty projects in the implementation process. By the late 1980s the focus had shifted to micro-enterprises, especially training, women's access to credit and policy implications (see Berger and Buvinic, 1989; Leonard, 1989; World Development 1989).

D. RESPONSES TO CITIES IN CRISIS (Late 1980s - 1990s)

Research on urban development since the mid 1980s has been increasingly dominated by the global economic crisis and the IMF and World Bank macro-economic reform packages of structural adjustment, designed to assist bankrupted economies onto the road of economic recovery. The most visible manifestations of cities in crisis has been the inability of the state and local government apparatus to effectively manage and regulate urban life, the breakdown in the formal instruments of control, such as the planning and legal system, and the decline in the delivery, maintenance and quality of essential urban services such as water, electricity, transportation, health and education.

The 'top down' response to cities in crisis is probably best epitomized by the World Bank's 1991 Urban Policy Paper which outlined a new agenda for the 1990s based on greater 'efficiency' and the interrelated priorities of productivity, poverty reduction and environment (World Bank, 1991). In identifying key constraints as infrastructure deficiencies, the regulatory framework governing urban markets for land and housing,

weak municipal institutions and inadequate financial services, the related research agenda concerned issues of policy reform, the management of urban infrastructure and financial services, and the improvement in regulatory frameworks and the financial and technical capacities of municipal institutions. To alleviate urban poverty, due to both short-term impacts of macroeconomic adjustment and the longer term structural problems of demographic growth, low productivity and constrained access to urban services a number of measures to manage both the economic and social aspects of poverty were recommended. Essentially a technical research agenda relating to such issues as regulatory mechanisms, privatization and 'governance', it was not directly concerned with the needs of people, or their gender disaggregation.

Coping in Cities in Crisis

As the economic crisis deepened so feminist research priorities also shifted from managing to coping, with a reappraisal of survival strategies of urban low income households. Essentially research focused at two levels.

The Urban Consequences of 'Male Bias' in Structural Adjustment Policies

First, within the broader research agenda concerned with the so-called 'social costs' of recession, stabilization and structural adjustment policies (SAPs), research focused on the particular implications and consequences of male bias implicit in such policies. While highly important such research has been particularly challenging to undertake, given the problematic theoretical and methodological issue of causality, and the thorny issue of the counterfactual (see Stewart, 1992; Moser 1992, 91). In introducing 'male bias' as the preferred term (rather than the more academic term gender subordination) Elson stated,

'By male bias I mean a bias that operates in favour of men as a gender, and against women as a gender, not that all men are biased against women....What is bias? It is asymmetry that is ill-founded or unjustified'(1991,3). She identified such biases as operating in everyday life, attitudes and activities, in theoretical reasoning and in public policy.

Although such research was not urban specific, three 'kinds of male bias' identified by Elson as underlying many SAPs, have had urban specific implications (Elson 1991: 6; Moser 1992). The first male bias concerned unpaid domestic work necessary for reproducing and maintaining human resources, and the extent to which SAPs implicitly assumed that processes carried out by women in such unpaid activities as caring for children, gathering fuel, processing food, preparing meals, and nursing the sick, would continue regardless of the way in which resources are reallocated (Elson, 1991). Studies in for instance Buenos Aires (Feijoo and Jelin, 1989) and Manila (Commonwealth Secretariat, 1989) examined the relationship between reproductive and

productive work, and raised the question as to how far SAPs were successful at the cost of longer and harder working days for women, forced to increase their labour both within the market and the household. Preoccupation was expressed regarding the extent to which women's labour was infinitely elastic, or whether a breaking point might be reached when their capacity to reproduce and maintain human resources might collapse (Jolly 1987).

The problem was not simply the elasticity of time, but also the use of time. Evidence from a longitudinal study of a low-income community in Guayaquil, Ecuador, for instance, showed that the real problem was not the length of time women worked, but the way they were changing the balance between activities undertaken in their triple roles. Forced to allocate increasing time to productive and community managing work, for many women reproductive work had become a secondary priority, delegated wherever possible to daughters or other female household members - with important implications for children, on women themselves and on the disintegration of the household (Moser 1992). Other studies highlighted the increase in child labour, not only in Latin American cities but also cities in Ghana (UNICEF, 1988) and Tanzania (Tibaijuka, 1988).

The second male bias concerned gender divisions of labour which ignored barriers to labour reallocation in policies designed to switch from non-tradeables to tradeables, by offering incentives to encourage labour intensive manufacturing. In the urban sector, gender barriers to the reallocation of labour meant greater unemployment for men displaced from non-tradeables, while for any women drawn into export oriented manufacturing, they have meant extra work as factory employment is added to the unpaid domestic work which unemployed men remained reluctant to undertake (Elson, 1991). In Brazil, for instance, while the very poor might move from one activity to another according to circumstances and need, men used to a stable job and waged employment had fewer options and experienced relatively long periods of unemployment (Hirata and Humphrey, 1991). Evidence from Guadelajara (Gonzalez de la Rocha, 1988), Guayaquil (Moser, 1992), Queretero (Chant, 1988) and Mexico City (Beneria, 1990) all showed increases in the number economically active in the household (particularly women), as well as changes in household composition - both a response to declining household income.

The third 'male bias' concerned the household as the social institution which was the source of the supply of labour. This concerned the assumption of equal intrahousehold distribution of resources, which in turn means that changes in resource allocations in income, food prices and public expenditure, accompanying stabilization and SAPs, affected all members of the household in the same way. Gender differentiated impact on intra-household resource distribution with particularly detrimental effects on the lives of children and women was also apparent. Urban studies from Jamaica (Davies and Anderson, 1989), Mexico (Beneria, 1990) and Peru (Cornia et al, 1987) showed that

austerity measures altered the budgets of practically all households, with poor families often eliminating meat, milk and other essential items from their diet. Research from Chile showed women in poor households experienced more than commensurate declines in food intake during periods of declining food availability (Raczynski and Serrano, 1985).

Research in Brazil (Barroso and Amado, 1989) alleged that the capacity of the household to shoulder the burden of adjustment had detrimental effects in terms of human relationships, expressed in increased domestic violence and mental health disorder and increasing numbers of women-headed households resulting from the breakdown in nuclear family structures. However, in contrast to this, in Guadelajara, Gonzalez de la Rocha (1988) found that the crisis forced men to surrender a larger portion of their wages to the 'gasto' (household budget).

Urban Survival Strategies in Crisis

A second research shift has been from research on the constraints for low-income women as a consequence of gender blind planning, to research on the constraints due to lack of provision of basic services. Studies of the daily lives of low-income women in Latin American cities such as Lima (Barrig and Fort, 1987), Quito (Rodriguez, 1990), Queretero (Chant, 1991), Sao Paulo (Volbedas, 1989) and Oaxaca (Selby, 1991); African cities such as Nairobi (Mitullah, 1991), Bamako (Vaal et al,1989) and urban Tanzania (Trip, 1989); and Asian cities such as Madras (Noponen, 1991), all described the complex strategies women within low-income urban households adopted to cope with the combined effects of declining income, increased food prices and a reduction in the level and composition of public expenditure on social sectors such as heath and education. These also included the identification of protest and resistance by women to such measures (Daines and Seddon (1991; Hardy, 1988).

Issues relating to food and hunger became an important research concern (Pryer and Crook, 1988). A new focus on distributional activities within the informal sector resulted in studies of, for instance, hawking in Nairobi (Mitullah, 1991) and the nutritional aspects of street-food vendors (Tinker, 1987; Cohen, 1986) with case studies in cities such as in Ife-Ife (Pearce et al 1988). Innovative 'survival strategies' received particular attention, because of their potential implications for policy makers. In Latin America these included a re-examination of the role that community or communal kitchens might play in providing cheeper food while releasing women from domestic labour. Studies from Lima, building on the earlier work of Sara-Lafoss (1984), in particular, highlighted both the constraints and opportunities for collective food provisioning entailing the joint purchase and cooking of food on especially equipped premises. In Sao Paulo community level wholesale purchase of food was encouraged (Macedo, 1988). In Africa the potential contribution that informal urban agriculture and women's food plots might make to household nutrition and food nutrition was examined

in cities such as Lusaka (Rakodi, 1988), peri-urban Gambia (Barrett and Browne, 1988) and Nairobi (Freeman, 1991). This strategy of growing food was meant, particularly among the chronic poor, as a means by which to substitute specific purchased food items with home grown produce.

PART THREE

THE ORGANIZATION OF RESEARCH ON WOMEN, GENDER AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT (1960S - 1990S)

The review in Part Two of research on women, gender and urbanization during the past three decades highlights a number of issues that set important parameters for the discussion of organizational and institutional issues. The fact that it essentially still remains a specialist concern, undertaken mainly by women academics and policy practitioners means that throughout, such research has been marginalized, underresourced and not taken seriously by most mainstream institutions or researchers.

Within this overall picture, it is nevertheless important to highlight a number of important shifts and changes, in the institutions involved in research on women, gender and urbanization, the sources and scale of financial support, and the research topics undertaken. Again the four 'periods' identified in Part Two provides a useful framework for such a review, with the addition of the 1975-85 UN Decade for Women as an extra critical landmark.

During the first 'period' of modernization, with urban research almost entirely gender-blind, the modest research agenda on women was undertaken by a scattering of women academics, generally graduate students or junior staff members, doing personal research projects from within mainstream social science discipline department such as anthropology, sociology or geography.

Despite the proliferation of urban sociological and anthropological research during the 1970s research on women continued to be undertaken primarily by individual women academics. As in the 1960s studies of women were not taken seriously, and often assessed not to be in the interests of career advancement. The ILO urban informal sector programme, for instance, although it commissioned a wide diversity of studies at country, city and sector level, did not allocate any resources to the study of women in the informal sector. In contrast to this, the UNRISD Participation Programme in the 1980s contained a component on women in social movements, although the rest of the programme remained essentially gender-blind. It was the second wave feminist movement of the late 1960s and the 1975-85 UN Decade for Women that fundamentally changed the situation in a number of ways.

Institutional Legitimacy

First, and foremost the UN Decade provided the beginnings of a tentative basis of legitimacy for Women in Development, Gender and Development and Women's

Studies as intellectual disciplines in their own right, particularly in the numerous development and area studies institutions established at that time. The struggles experienced by women academics in setting up departments, units or courses, and being taken seriously by their male colleagues, are legend; the critical point is that since the 1970s intellectual and academic interest has grown continuously, and continues to do so today. In the climate of cutbacks and recession in many academic departments student demand makes WID/GAD research one of the few expansion areas, witnessed by the enormous growth in books published in this area, and the development of gender-specific publishers and publisher lists. In reality, the fact that it remains lucrative in terms of student numbers has probably done more to grudgingly convince cynical male colleagues of its legitimacy, than has a genuine change in their intellectual or ideological conviction about the discipline itself. Other than in a few more liberal institutions, the majority of staff remain female, and at lower levels in the institution.

Resource Allocations for WID/GAD Research

Since 1975 resources allocated to WID/GAD research have increased in both absolute and relative terms, although they still remain very small. At the same time, within the topic, women in urban areas, and gendered urban research have not been identified as a priority, particularly in Asia and Africa. The critical role women play in agricultural production and food security, and its links to economic development have ensured the targeting of resources to these issues by bilaterals and NGOs alike. The later, in particular, have in many cases retained a pro-rural bias, because it is in rural areas that the absolute poor are concentrated in largest numbers. Research support for urban work has come primarily from a limited number of more imaginative independent foundations. A good example of this, the Population Council (itself funded by such institutions as the Ford Foundation) has proved resources for innovative programmes such as that of Gender Training, and the Women, Low-Income Households and Basic Urban Services Project. The Ford Foundation itself has been responsible for a wide diversity of research projects in urban areas.

From 'Pure' to Action Oriented Research

Donors have influenced the sectors of research focus - issues relating to women in their reproductive role, such as children nutrition, family planning and now women and the environment, have been popular from the outset and are still prioritized. They have also influenced the <u>type of research</u> undertaken and been instrumental in the shift from pure analytical research, to more applied approaches.

Research agendas reflect the political and ideological agendas of the donors. Thus donors such as USAID have played an important role in determining a WID focus for policy related research on women and small scale enterprises, credit and other income generating activities. In contrast to this Nordic donors, for instance, have provided

resources for more sensitive areas of GAD research relating to such issues as women's legal rights, domestic violence, and women's reproductive rights. Both are open to criticism for setting agendas 'top down', reflecting the interest of particular groups within the countries concerned.

During the Decade for Women one of the most important Third World research coalitions, DAWN (Development Alternatives with Women for a New Era)(see DAWN, 1985) played a critical role in shifting research agendas to reflect the 'bottom up' interests and needs of Third World women. This coalition, and others developing among and between women in the South, has been critical in shifting research agendas. In the Philippines, for instance, Canadian CIDA now allocates resources to the 'Group of 10' (a group of 10 Women's NGOs) who then making decisions about action oriented priorities.

Women's NGOs and research groups have relied heavily on external donor support for the development of their institutional capacity. Given the preference of donors during the 1980s to funds Women's NGOs rather than University based academic research groups, in many contexts the former have developed greater empirical research capacity. However because their research, by design, is action-oriented and short term in focus, their analytical capacity for in-depth analysis has not been as strong as might be desirable to confront mainstream institutions. Such organizations are either independent or form a women's research unit in a larger organization, but running their own independent women's research programme. In neither case is their work generally taken seriously by others working on urban development issues, although there are some important exceptions to this, particularly in Latin America.

PART FOUR

CITIES AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT: CONCLUSIONS AND CHALLENGES FOR THE 1990S

Part Four highlights some conclusions from the research review, and in so doing identifies some of the many research challenges for the 1990s. This is by no means a comprehensive checklist, but more a choice of topics arising from literature surveys and discussions with both Third World and First World women.

Conclusions from the Research Review

In each of the four identified 'periods' of Third World urban development identified in Part Two, the review highlights a number of important, clearly defined sequential stages in the research agenda on women, gender and urban development - stages that get repeated in each of the four 'periods' of urban development.

The first stage can be identified as that of gender-blind research. Although in the 1960s and 1970s this was much more glaring than it is today, nevertheless gender-blindness still prevents most researchers and policy makers alike from appreciating the pivotal nature of gender relations in determining women's participation in urban life, their roles in resolving urban problems and planning for urban futures. Although the numbers of low-income women in cities in many areas of the Third World, and the daily problems they face are escalating, too little is still known of their experiences and perspectives.

When women themselves and the gender roles and relations within which they are embedded are not integrated into the urban problematic, then they are neither integrated into mainstream urban policy nor are their needs met. In the 1980s and 1990s, when gender-blind research addresses women it tends to be based on the assumption that it is simply as a matter of 'add women and stir'.

The second stage is concerned with 'proving' that women are important, let alone visible, in the urban development agenda addressed. In the review this was most graphically described in the case of the informal sector, where until quite recently prominently researcher institutions, such as at the ILO, had simply deemed them invisible. Most of the work 'counting women in' has been undertaken within a WID framework. This 'women and.... (housing/health/water etc) research' descriptively documents the participation of women in the different urban sector, but tends to focus on women as a category in themselves.

In the third stage research shifts from women per se to gender. It is concerned with the identification of the manner and extent to which urban life is gendered, and the manner in which in different contexts the social construction of gender relations differentially constrain men and women's access to, and participation in, such areas of urban life. This research is undertaken in a GAD framework, and is concerned with difference between women as well as between men and women. In the review, the detailed description of the extensive gendered research on the housing sector provides an example of this approach.

The fourth stage is concerned with policy prescriptions and recommendations. Given the political difficulties and 'cultural' sensitivities of prescriptions that address gender inequalities, or what has been identified as strategic gender needs, most policy focused research has been undertaken within a WID framework (Moser 1989a, 1993). Thus research on such areas as income generating activities, credit and skill training for women is most frequently undertaken from an anti-poverty or efficiency policy perspective and is intended to address practical gender needs.

In each of the four identified 'periods' of Third World urban development these four clearly differentiated stages occur in research on women, gender and urban development. In reality they do not always occur sequentially, with policy oriented research occurring at any stage in the process. The review highlights a number of issues with important implications for the current research agendas in the 1990s.

In reality, over the past three decades there has been the development of a remarkable body of GAD research that highlights the nature of gender relationships in urban life. However, it would appear that this research has had little influence on either mainstream urban researchers or on policy-makers. Most of this research is still a specialist concern, undertaken by women. Other than some of recent research on employment and urban labour markets, it is still outside the mainstream of urban development research which has remained essentially remained gender-blind. Those concerned with policy have felt more comfortable with WID focused research, choosing to address interventions that assists women within their existing roles in society, rather than those that challenge gender divisions of labour or the nature of gender subordination. Therefore for many researchers the first priority for the 1990s is the mainstreaming of what is still essentially a separate specialist concern. As long as it remains an 'add on' it will have little influence on the important policy agendas. Aside from this, however, there are a number of continuing as well as new agendas for the 1990s. The list is by no means inclusive and at this draft stage does not disaggregate at a regional level, but does no more than identify a number of potential research agendas.

Research Agendas for the 1990s

Listening to Women and Hearing What they Say: Differences Between Women in the Urban Context.

As Afshar (1991) notes:

'We are weary of the tendency to generalize about women; although in their biological and reproductive roles women experience a communality of functions and responsibilities, they are less cohesive in their experiences of domesticity and the extent to which the double burden of nurturing and productivity come into daily conflict' (1991,3).

One major new priority for gendered urban research in the 1990s is that of finding a meeting point between approaches that emphasize commonalities as against differences between women; these include First World versus Third World representations of women; representation that focuses on seeing women at the expense of hearing their voices; research that is univocal i.e. top down and centralized in its policy approach versus that which is fragmented, disseminated through grassroots networks and having its origins with poor Third World women.

Increasing recognition of women's differential experiences of oppression, as emphasized by both Jayawardena (1986) and DAWN (1985) highlighted not only its cultural specificity, but also the need to deconstruct an understanding of the term 'women'. Women's experiences of urban life differ not only from place to place, but also within places depending on a network of inter-related social constructions such as age, 'race', ethnicity, class, and religion. Other factors affecting women's experiences include their marital status, their housing status, whether they are employed or not, whether they are responsible for children, and whether they are being physically or emotionally abused.

A research agenda that focuses on difference will mean that the rationale for prioritizing any one social relation or circumstance in relation to women's oppression will no longer exist, with less tendency to create a hierarchy of oppressed women. In addition it will open up the political and analytical space for a consideration of the specific problems faced by different groups of women who have previously received little attention such as the elderly, homeless, refugee, immigrant, abused and lesbian women.

This research also requires more participatory methodologies that allow women themselves to identify their similarities and differences. One such example, for instance, women's testimonies, are by no means new and have long been an important component of action-research. The diary of a poor Sao Paulo woman, Caroline Maria de Jesus, published as early as 1962, (de Jesus, 1962) and Domitila (1978), wife of a Bolivian

miner trade union leader provide just two powerful examples. In the 1980s testimonies of women, in for instance, Santiago (Raczynski and Serano, 1985), became an important voice of the disempowered, unable to the prove the causality of SAPS, but suffering the consequences of the 'crisis'. To date, the tendency however has been for mainstream researchers to dismiss such testimonies as anecdotal, 'apt illustration'.

Women, Citizenship, Democratization and Decentralization

The collapse of old political divisions between East and West, and in the traditional relationship between North and South, has resulted in both ideological and political upheavals and economic crises. One manifestation has been the return to democracy, which in turn has called for increased decentralization and the redefinition of citizenship. A culture of entitlement has arisen whereby citizens recognize that they have the right to participate in the political decision making that affects their lives. Research into the gendered aspects of these new and different political processes relating to the increasing setting of the agenda by Third World women themselves, is another new priority. Hearing the voices of the oppressed, and listening to different discourses of resistance must relate to this agenda. To date, issues relating to the role of women in local municipal government is one of the few areas addressed, with important work already undertaken in both Chile (Raczynski and Serrano, 1992) and Brazil (UNICEF/IBAM, 1991, Blay, 1990). Within urban arena these social and political developments have also manifest themselves in the reorganization of urban space. (Valdes, 1991). Again Latin American research in, for instance, Quito (Leon, 1991) and Rio de Janiero (Lavinas and Ribiero, 1992) have begun to address this issue.

Women, Social Unrest and Violence

In addition, as old urban spatial patterns fragment there is a redefinition of the spatial bases of power in the city. The cultural dimensions of these processes of dissolution and reconstitution have manifested themselves in increasing social anarchy, and exacerbated levels of social unrest and violence. The increasing fragmentation of urban life, resulting in a rise in the levels of absolute and relative poverty, has become a source of insecurity, altering the uses of urban space. Violence and criminality are affecting the coping strategies of households. At the same time, urban population which were marginalised under existing regimes are in the process of devising new urban cultures and new expressions of citizenship such as street gangs of homeless children, women's organizations against male violence and other social movements (Blondet, 1991).

In some contexts, recent macro-level social and economic changes have had the effect of causing men in low-income households to lose their position as sole or principal breadwinners. It has been women in these households that have been responsible for organizing household and communal strategies against increasing levels of poverty.

Researchers in Latin America have argued that men have not only had their authority weakened but also their identities. An ECLAC (1991) study from Santiago entitled 'Porque los hombres son tan irresponsables?' ('Why are men so irresponsible?') claims that men associate women's economic dependency with fidelity, and their own superiority. Hence in attempts to reassert their authority they resort to violence. In India, researchers have identified violence against women not only in terms of domestic violence, female infanticide, and 'sati' (Sood, 1990), but also dowry deaths, the burning of brides who had not paid full dowry to their husband's families, identified particularly as an urban phenomenon (Kumari, 1989).

A recent review of policy responses to violence against women in Latin America and the Caribbean (ISIS, 1990) noted a diversity of successful initiatives indicated the scale of the problem. These include battered women's centres, initiated by women's groups and then taken over by government; self-help or support groups, usually set up by NGOs, such as Woman Space in Buenos Aires; safe houses or shelters, such as the Julia Burgos Safe House in Puerto Rico; legal offices and assistance bureaus to inform women of their legal rights, training programmes for legal outreach workers; women's police stations staffed by women's officer, such as in Argentina, Colombia Costa Rica, Peru, Uruguay, and Venezuela, and Brazil where they are most developed; telephone services such as in the Municipality of Buenos Aries, which started in February 1990 operating on a 24 hour basis, and by Dec 1991 had taken 12,000 calls.

The importance of domestic violence is not simply its effect on women. ECLAC, for instance, argue that violence is an obstacle to development.

'Abuse and aggression directed against women in the home by their partners is part of a larger picture of social and political violence, discrimination and the marginalization of broad sectors of society in Latin America.' (ECLAC, 1992,14). While research on domestic violence is not new, its implications for urban development processes raises new issues for the research agenda.

Gender and the Urban Environment

Current preoccupations with the environment, by both researchers and policy-makers alike, has increased the profile of this research topic enormously in the past few years. Therefore this is not a new research area, but one in which considerable problems exist, requiring more analytical work. First, it is clear that to date most research has been concerned with 'proving' that women are important in environmental issues as producers, collectors, carriers, producers, consumers and so on. Second, the focus has been far more on rural issues of natural resource sustainability, than on urban resource issues. Third, research has primarily been descriptive and concerned with the 'women and...' be it water, housing, or land - all issues previously researched as individual

sectoral preoccupations, and now loosely joined together under the overall term 'environment' (see, for instance, Dankelman and Davidson, 1988; Sontheimer, 1991)

In a recent literature review, Kjellberg Bell (1991) identified two sets of perspective. One relates to the way in which women in urban areas operate within their environment, and includes issues such as women's requirements for land and housing, the structure of households and families, women's responses to urbanization, their ways of earning income and their access to services. The second set relates to the impact on urban women of environmental degradation. She argues that,

'Women are in direct and daily contact with the environment through their use of resources (food, fuel and water) and through their efforts to maintain secure and healthy environments for their families.' (1991,92).

Kjellber Bell argues that if sustainable development is to be achieved then women's roles in these two perspectives must be central, both within their households and within their communities.

However, there is still no comprehensive analytical framework which shifts the discourse from women to gender, and allows for the identification of the manner and extent to which the urban environment is gendered. To date the most profound work has been by the Indian feminist physicist, Vandana Shiva (1988). As she herself admits, her work on ecological sustainability and diversity has focused on the position of women in relation to nature - the forests, food chain and water supplies - all of paramount concern in the green environmental agenda of rural contexts. Still to be developed is its implications for the 'brown' environmental agenda, the priority of cities and towns.

Concluding Comment

The vast majority of urban development research and policies still does not mention women. Research that does still tends to be conducted by women, and to be dominated by a WID 'women and the city' approach, rather than by gendered analyses of urban development processes. Nevertheless, as this review has highlighted the changes in the last three decades have been remarkable. No longer do researchers refer to 'male towns', or men in cities. However, there is still a considerable challenge ahead, not least of all, to listen to women themselves.

ENDNOTES:

- 1. An earlier draft of this paper was undertaken in collaboration with Linda Peake. I should like to acknowledge her contribution, particularly in Part One and Four. I should also like to thank both Richard Stren and Judith Bell for their logistical support in the writing of this article.
- 2. For a detailed discussion of the historical development of WID and GAD and the important distinctions between them see Moser (1993, Chapter 1).
- 3. This focus on 'gender' rather than 'women' has been influenced by such writers as Oakley (1972), Ruben (1975) and Whitehead (1979).
- 4. Reproductive work includes both childbearing and rearing activities required to guarantee the reproduction and maintenance of the labour force; productive work comprises work for payment in both cash or kind; community managing work comprises activities undertaken by women, particularly in the urban context around the provision of items of collective consumption (see Moser 1989a, 1993).
- 5. For a detailed definition of each of the policy approaches to women in development, see Moser (1989a, 1993). Shifts in policy approaches to women have mirrored general shifts in Third World development policy from modernization policies of accelerated growth, through basic needs strategies associated with redistribution, to the more compensatory measures associated with structural adjustment (Moser, 1989a, 1807).
- 6. It has been said that the origins of the Manchester School of Urban Anthropology began as a consequence of the fact that when the British based male anthropologists first went to do fieldwork, because there were no 'people' (i.e. men) in the rural areas, they rapidly change their fieldwork location to urban areas. The lack of a comparable number of rural studies focusing on the women left behind would tend to support this thesis.
- 7. Interestingly, Mayer was assisted in this study by his wife, Iona Mayer. Although her contribution was formally acknowledged in the title pager of Mayer's book, *Townsmen or Tribesmen*, she did not appear as joint author.
- 8. For a succinct critique of the theory of the culture of poverty, see Wade (19).
- 9. It was the work of Boserup and other anthropologists that lead the SID/WID group in Washington D.C. to work to influence USAID policy. Lobbying of Congress, and participation in Congressional hearings, resulted in the 1973 Percy Amendment to the US Foreign Assistance Act which mandated that US assistance help 'move women into their national economies' in order to improve women's status and assist in the development process' (Maguire, 1984; Tinker, 1982).

- 10. Kay (1989) provides a useful historical review of Latin American theories of dependency.
- 11. In terms of the insiders/outsiders discourse it is important to note that not all studies undertaken by outsiders have since been well received by local women. Wikan's account of the lives of low-income women in Cairo, for instance, has been severely criticized by Egyptian women anthropologists on the grounds that her lack of sensitivity to local issues results in an exaggerated, distorted account of the brutality and despair of women's lives. Certainly her 'fieldwork notes' suggest a difficulty 'integrating' into the local scene. For instance, in describing her daily travel to the local community she comments:

'I had to travel on overfull buses where most of the passengers were men, and most of them tried to fondle me. But once I arrived at the bus stop by the poor neighbourhood, the worst trail awaited me: I had to run the gauntlet of the market street which was very crowded and included a large number of men who were a constant annoyance. I developed a defence technique, hitting my handbag against any man who came near me, and also acquired the greatest repertoire of invectives in the area'. (1976, 11)

- 12. See Moser (1978) for a detail description of this research, which includes an extensive bibliography of ILO country, city and sector studies.
- 13. For a general review, both urban and rural, of the underestimation of women's economic activities, see Beneria (1981). For the specific case of India, see Bhattacharya (1985). For a recent analysis as to how women's work can be accurately included in the Indian Census, see Krishnaraj (1990).
- 14. Analysts of the basic needs concept concluded that as an approach to poverty alleviation it essentially had two variations, identified as conservative/radical (Sandbrook, 1982); shallow/deep (Galtung, 1980) or weak/strong (Wisner, 1988). Wisner further distinguished between Basic Needs as an end or as a means; advocates of the weak basic needs argued that needs could be met through existing structures of society (delivery systems, markets); in contrast proponents of strong Basic Needs believe that this goal can only be attained if the means of meeting basic needs so empower poor people that they become agents in creating a more just society. (Wisner, 1988,30). Linked to this is the issue of **popular participation** and the extent to which in basic needs projects it was identified either as a critical integral component for the entire project planning process, as against a narrow cheap-labour add-on for project implementation a theme which by the 1980's had reached the urban research agenda.
- 15. Books edited by Ward (1982), Payne (1984) and Mathey, (1992) have all provided useful contributions to the self-help housing debate.

- 16. Moser (1989) reviews community participation in urban projects, evaluating selfhelp housing projects undertaken by multilaterals, national governments and NGOs from a gender perspective.
- 17. See A.M.Scott (1989) for a later more developed description of the thesis.
- 18. The Chilean case study provided a tragic example of the gender conflicts which emerged when women moved into the public arena, in this case the MIR, a left wing political party. As Castells described it:

'The MIR organized a women's militia that took case of a variety of tasks, particularly to do with health but also in matters of self-defence. But this was not supported by a change of attitude of men towards 'their women', who were still unable to participate in collective activities. So it further isolated the few political women and exposed them to the criticism and distrust of the housewives...illustrated by the general blame put by almost the entire campamento on a woman whose unguarded child drowned while she was working at the health centre (Castells, 1983, 206).

- 19. For an interesting discussion of the limitations and potential of women in South African urban residential struggle, see Gwagwa (1990).
- 20. See West and Blumberg (1990) for a useful review of the reconstruction of social protest from a feminist perspective, but which focuses almost entirely on advanced economies.
- 21. In undertaking this review it has been necessary to recognize that the boundaries between protest and 'community managing' are often difficult to identify. Consequently, in this section, both are discussed together.
- 22. For a later review of these issues, which includes comparative UK experience, see Levy (1992).
- 23. For extensive reviews of this issue see Moser and Chant (1985) and Moser (1987).
- 24. See Chant (1989) for a useful detailed discussion of this issue which includes other examples.

BIBLIOGRAPHY (PROVISIONAL)

- Afshar, H. (ed) (1985) Women, Work and Ideology in the Third World, London Tavistock.
- Afshar, H. (ed) (1991) Women, Development and Survival in the Third World, London, Longman.
- Alfonja, S. (1981) 'Changing modes of production and the sexual division of labour among the Yoruba', Signs, 7:2.
- Altorki, S. (1977) 'Family Organization and Women's Power in Urban Saudi Arabian Society' *Journal of Anthropological Research* 33, No. 3: 277-287.
- Andreas, C. (1985) When Women Rebel: the Rise of Popular Feminism in Peru, Connecticut, Lawrence Hill.
- Anderson, J. and Panzio, N. (1986) 'Transportation and public safety: services that make service use possible' in Schmink, M., Bruce, J. and Kohn, M. (eds) (1986) Learning about Women and Urban Services in Latin America and the Caribbean, New York: The Population Council.
- Anker, R. and C. Hein. (1986) Sex Inequalities in Urban Employment in the Third World, St. Martin's: ILO.
- Arizpe, L. (1977) 'Women in the Informal Labor Sector: The Case of Mexico City' Signs 3, No. 1: 25-37.
- Armstrong, M. (1987) Women's Friendships under Urbanization: A Malaysian Study. *Women's Studies International Forum* 10, No. 6: 623-633.
- Ayllon Viana, R. (1982) 'Organización de una guaderia infantil con la población femenina del Pueblo Joven Huascar', Paper presented at the research conference on Women in the Andean Region, Lima.
- Bakhtiari, Q. A. (1984) *Community Management For Sanitation*, Case Study of the Baldia Soak Pit Project, UNICEF, mimeo.
- Bamberger M. and Deneke A. (1984) 'Can Shelter Programmes Meet Low-Income Needs? The Experience of El Salvador', in Payne G.(ed), *Low-Income Housing in the Developing World*, Wiley.

- Banck, G. and Doimo, A.M. (1989) 'Between utopia and strategy: A case study of a Brazilian urban social movement' in F. Schuurman and T. von Naerssen (eds), Urban Social Movement in the Third World, London, Routledge.
- Banerjee, N. (1981) 'The Weakest Link', Institute of Development Studies Bulletin, 12,3.
- Banerjee, N. (1985) Women Workers in the Unorganized Sector Hyderabad: Sangam Books.
- Barrett, H. and Browne, A. (1988) 'Women's horticulture in the peri-urban zone, the Gambia." *Geography* 73, No. 2, 158-160.
- Barrig, M. and Fort, A. (1987) 'La Ciudad de las Mujeres: Pobladoras y Servicios. El Caso de El Augustino', Women, Low-Income Households and Urban Services Working Papers, Lima.
- Barrios de Chungara, D. (1978) Let me Speak, New York, Monthly Review Press.
- Barroso, C. and Amado, T. (1989) 'Impact of the crisis on the health of poor urban women: the case of Brazil' in UNICEF (ed) *The Invisible Adjustment: Poor Women and the Economic Crisis*, Bogota, UNICEF.
- Bauer, J. (1992) 'Gender Inequality in Urban China: Education and Employment.' *Modern China: An International Quarterly of History and Social Science* 18, July: 333-370.
- Beneria, L (1981) 'Conceptualizing the labour force: the underestimation of women's activities' in Nelson, N. (ed) African Women in the Development Process, London, Frank Cass.
- Beneria, L. and M. Roldan (1987) *The Crossroads of Class and Gender* Chicago, University of Chicago Press.
- Berger, M. and Buvinic, M. (eds) (1989) Women's Ventures: Assistance to the Informal Sector in Latin America, Connecticut, Kumarian Press
- Blay, E.A. (1990) 'Facing alienation: women and local power' paper presented to the XII World Congress of Sociology, Madrid, July
- Blondet, C. (1990) 'Establishing an identity: Women settlers in a poor Lima neighbourhood' in Jelin, E. (ed) Women and Social Change in Latin America, London, Zed.

- Blondet, Cecilia. (1991) 'Las organizaciones femininas y la politica en epoca de crisis' in Feijoo, M. del C. and Herzer, H. (ed) *Las Mujeres y la Vida de las Ciudades*, Buenos Aires, Instituto Internacional de Medio Ambiente y Desarrollo (IIED) America Latina
- Bohman, K. (1984) Women of the Barrio: Class and Gender in a Colombian City, Stockholm, Studies in Social Anthropology.
- Bolles, A.L. (1986) 'Economic crisis and female-headed households in Jamaica' in J. Nash and H. Saffa (eds) Women and Change in Latin America, Massachusetts, Bergin and Garvey
- Borja, J. (1975) 'Movimientos urbanos y cambio politico' Revista Mexicana de Sociologia, 43, (4) 1341-1369.
- Boserup, E. (1970) Woman's Role in Economic Development, New York: St. Martins Press.
- Brines, J. (1991) 'Women, Work and Marriage in Urban India: A Study of Dual-earner and Single-earner Couples' *American Journal of Sociology* 97, no. 3: 880-883.
- Bromley, R. and Gerry, C (1979) Casual Work and Poverty in Third World Cities, London, Wiley.
- Bruce, J. (1980) Market Women's Co-operatives: Giving Women Credit, New York: Population Council.
- Bujra, J. (1975) 'Women "Entrepreneurs" of Early Nairobi', Canadian Journal of African Studies, 9, 2, 213-34.
- Bujra, J. (1986) 'Urging women to redouble their efforts....': Class gender and capitalist transformation in Africa' in C. Robertson and I. Berger (eds) Women and Class in Africa, 117-40, New York: Africana Publishing Company.
- Burgess, R. (1978) Petty Commodity Housing or Dweller Control? A Critique of John Turner's Views on Housing Policy, *World Development*, vol 6 no 9/10.
- Burgess, R. (1987) Some Common Misconceptions about Self-Help Housing Policies in Less Developed Countries, *African Urban Quarterly*, 2 (4), 365-77.
- Burgess, R. (1992) Helping Some to Help Themselves: Third World Housing Policies and Development Strategies, in Mathey (ed) *Beyond Self-Help Housing. London*, Mansell.

- Buster, X. and Chaney, E. (1982) Sellers and Servants: Working Women in Lima, Peru. New York, Praeger.
- Buvinic, M. (1983) 'Women's Issues in Third World Poverty: A Policy Analysis', in Buvinic, M., Lycette, M. and McGreevey, W., Women and Poverty in the Third World, Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press.
- Buvinic, M. (1986) 'Projects for Women in the Third World: Explaining their Misbehaviour', World Development, Vol. 14 No. 5.
- Buvinic, M., Youssef, N. with Von Elm, B. (1978) 'Women-Headed Households: The Ignored Factor in Development Planning', Report submitted to the Office of Women in Development, Agency for International Development, Washington D.C.: International Center for Research on Women.
- Caplan, P. (1978) 'Women's Organizations in Madras City, India' in Caplan, P. and Bujra, J. (eds) Women United, Women Divided, London: Tavistock.
- Caplan, P. (1985) Class and Gender in India: Women and their Organizations in a South Indian City, London: Tavistock.
- Cardosa, F.H. 'Dependency and Development in Latin America, *New Left Review*, no 74.
- Castell, M. (1978) City, Class and Power, London, Edward Arnold.
- Castells, M. (1982) Squatters and politics in Latin America: A comparative analysis of urban social movements in Chile, Peru and Mexico' in H.Safa (ed) *Towards a Political Economy of Urbanization in Third World Countries*, Delhi, Oxford University Press.
- Castells, M. (1983) The City and the Grassroots, London: Edward Arnold.
- Centre for Urban and Community Studies (1992) Summary Report of Regional Workshops; Ford Foundation Project: Urban Research in the Developing World: Towards an Agenda for the 1990s, University of Toronto.
- Chant, S. (1985) Single-parent families: choice or constraint? The formation of female-headed households in Mexican shantytowns' in *Development and Change*, 16, 635-56
- Chant, S. (1987) 'Family Structure and Female Labour in Queretero, Mexico' in J. Momsen and J.Townsend (eds) *Geography of Gender in the Third World*, London, Hutchinson.

- Chant, S. (1991) Women and Survival in Mexican Cities: Perspectives on Gender, Labour Markets, and Low-Income Households, Manchester: St. Martin's Press.
- Chant, S. and Bryden, L. (1989) Women in the Third World, Aldershot, Edward Elgar
- Chauhen S. (ed.) (1983) 'Green Flag Over Baldia Pit Latrines', in Who Puts The Water In The Taps? Earthscan, London.
- Chen, M. (1991) 'Status of the Elderly in Urban China.' Society 15, No. 1: 16-24.
- Commonwealth Scretariat. (1989) Engendering Adjustment for the 1990s: Report of the Commonwealth Expert Group on Women and Structural Adjustment, London, Commonwealth Secretariat.
- Cohen, M. (1986) 'Women and the Urban Street Food Trade: Some Implications for Policy', *DPU Gender and Planning Working Paper no 12*, London: Development Planning Unit
- Cole, J. (1987) Crossroads: the Politics of Reform and Repression, 1976-1986, Johannesburg, Ravan Press.
- Collier, D. (1976) Squatters and Oligarchs: Authoritarian Rule and Policy Change in Peru, Baltimore, John Hopkins University Press.
- Connolly, P. (1982) Uncontrolled Settlements and Self-Build: What kind of Solution? The Mexico case, in Ward, P. (ed) Self-Help Housing A Critique, London, Mansell.
- Cornelius, W. (1975) *Politics and the Migrant Poor in Mexico City*, Stanford, Stanford University Press.
- Cornia, G., Jolly, R., and Stewart, F., (eds) (1987) Adjustment with a Human Face, vol 1, Oxford, Oxford University Press.
- Cornia, G., Jolly, R., and Stewart, F., (eds) (1988) Adjustment with a Human Face, vol 2, Oxford, Oxford University Press.
- Cousins W. (1977) Urban Community Development in Hyderabad, *Social Action*, New Delhi, India.
- Cousins W. and Goyder C. (1986) 'Hyderabad Urban Development Project', in Cheema G. (ed.) Reaching The Urban Poor Project Implementation In Developing Countries, Westview Special Studies in Social, Political and Economic Development.

- Daines, V. and Seddon, D. (1991) 'Survival struggles, protest and resistance: Women's responses to 'austerity' and 'structural adjustment'. *Gender Analysis in Development* No.4. Norwich, University of East Anglia Press.
- Dandekar, H. 1986. Men to Bombay, Women at Home; Urban Influence on Sugao Village, Deccan, Maharashtra, India, 1942 1982. Ann Arbor: Center for South and Southeast Asian Studies, University of Michigan.
- Dankelman, I. and Davidson, J. (1988) Women and the Environment in the Third World; Alliance for the Future, London, Earthscan.
- Davies, O. and Anderson, A. (1989) 'The impact of the recession and adjustment policies on poor urban women in Jamaica' in UNICEF (ed) *The Invisible Adjustment: Poor Women and the Economic Crisis*, Bogota, UNICEF.
- de Jesus, C. (1962) Child of the Dark, New York, Signet
- Deneke A. and Silva M. (1982) 'Housing Built by Mutual Help and Progressive Development: To What End?', in Ward P.(ed) Self-Help Housing: A Critique, Alexandrine Press, London.
- de Wit, J. (1989) Clientelism, competition and poverty: the ineffectiveness of local organizations in a Madras slum', in F. Schuurman and T. von Naerssen (eds), *Urban Social Movement in the Third World*, London, Routledge.
- Díaz, L. (1988) ' El papel de la mujer en la autoconstrucción de vivienda, Zona Metropolitana de Guadelajara' in Gabayet et al (eds) *Mujeres y Sociedad: Salario, Hogar y Acción social en el Occidiente de México*, Guadelajara, el Colegio de Jalisco.
- Dirasse, L. (1978) 'The socio-economic position of women in Addis Ababa: the case of prostitution,' unpublished Ph.D., Boston University.
- Dwyer, D. and Bruce, J. (1988) A Home Divided: Women and Income in the Third World Stanford University Press, Stanford.
- Eckstein, S. (1977) The Poverty of Revolution: The State and the Urban Poor in Mexico, Princeton, Princeton University Press.
- ECLAC (1991) "Por que los hombres son tan irresponsables?" (LC/R.1071) Santiago, ECLAC.

- Eden, J. (1991) 'Mobilisation and Employment of Female Labour in Malaysia' *Pacific Viewpoint* 32, No. 1: 66-77.
- Elson, D. (1991) 'Male Bias in Macro-Economics: the Case of Structural Adjustment' in Elson, D. (ed) *Male Bias in the Development Process*, Manchester: Manchester University Press.
- Elson, D. and Pearson, R. (1981a) The Subordination of Women and the Internationalization of Factory Production, in Young, K. et al (ed) *Of Marriage* and the Market, London, CSE.
- Elson, D. and Pearson, R. (1981b) 'Nimble Fingers Make Cheap Workers': An Analysis of Women's Employment in Third World Export Manufacturing', Feminist Review 7 (Spring).
- Epstein, A. L. (1958) *Politics in an African Urban Community*, Manchester University Press.
- Etiene, M. (1983) 'Gender relations and conjugality among the Baule' in C. Oppong (ed) Female and Male in West Africa, London, George Allen and Unwin.
- Evans, A. (1989) 'Women: Rural Development and Gender Issues in rural Household Economics', *Discussion Paper 254*, Sussex: Institute of Development Studies
- Fadayomi, T. (1991) 'Women in the Nigerian Labour Force' *International Journal of Sociology of the Family* 21, No. 2: 175-188.
- Fals Borda, O. (1985) 'Movimientos sociales' in Taller Nacional, *Moviementos Sociales* y *Participacion Comunitaria*, Medellin.
- Fawcett, J., Khoo, S-E, Smith, P, (1984) Women in the Cities of Asia: Migration and Urban Adaptation, Boulder, Colorado, Westview Press.
- Feijoo, M. del C. and Gogna, M. (1990) Women in the Transition to Democracy' in Jelin, E. (ed) Women and Social Change in Latin America, London, Zed.
- Feijoo, M. del C. and Jelin, E. (1989) 'Women from low income sectors: economic recession and democratization of politics' in UNICEF (ed) *The Invisible Adjustment: Poor Women and the Economic Crisis*, Bogota, UNICEF.
- Fernando, M. (1987) 'New Skills for Women: A Community Development Project in Colombo, Sri Lanka' in Moser, C.O.N. and Peake, L. (eds), Women, Human Settlements and Housing, London: Tavistock.

- Fernandez-Kelly, P. (1980) 'The Maquila Women', NACLA Report on the Americas 14
- Folbre, N., (1986) Hearts and spades: paradigms of household economics' World Development, Vol. 14 No. 2, pp 245-55.
- Frank, A. (1966) 'The Development of Underdevelopment' Monthly Review, 18 (4).
- Freeman, D. (1991) A City of Farmers: Informal Urban Agriculture in the Open Spaces of Nairobi, Kenya, Kingston, McGill-Queens University Press
- Galtung, J., "The New International Economic Order and the Basic Needs Approach", in *The North/South Debate*, Working Paper No. 12, New York, Institute for World Order, 1980.
- Girling, R., Lycette, M. and Youssef, N. (1983) A Preliminary Examination of the Panama Self-Help Women's Construction Project, Washington DC, International Centre for Research on Women.
- Gluckman, M. (1958) 'Analysis of a Social Situation in Modern Zululand' *Rhodes-Livingstone Papers No. 28*, Manchester University Press.
- Goddard, V. (1981) 'The Leather Trade in the Bassi of Naples', *Institute of Development Studies Bulletin*, Vol. 12 Vol. 3.
- Gonzalez de la Rocha, M. (1988) 'Economic crisis, domestic reorganization and women's work in Guadelajara, Mexico' in *Bulletin of Latin American Research*, 7, 2, 207-223.
- Gordon, E. (1981) 'An Analysis of the Impact of Labour Migration on the Lives of Women in Lesotho' in Nelson, N. (ed) *African Women in the Development Process*, London, Frank Cass.
- Gugler, J. 1989. "Women Stay on the Farm No More: Changing Patterns of Rural Urban Migration in Sub-Saharan Africa." *Journal of Modern African Studies* 27, No. 2: 347-352.
- Gwagwa, L. (1990) 'Women in South African Urban Residential Struggles', paper presented at Seminar on Housing and Gender, Lund, Sweden, Oct.
- Hansen, K. (1980) 'The Urban Informal Sector as a Development Issue: Poor Women and Work in Lusaka, Zambia' *Urban Anthropology* 9, No. 2: 199-225.
- Hardy, C. (1988) Organizarse para Vivir. Pobreza Urbana y Organización Popular, Programa de Economía del Trabajo, PET, Santiago.

- Hasan, A. (1985) The Low Cost Sanitation Programme of the Orangi Pilot Project, Karachi, Pakistan, paper for workshop on Community Health and the Urban Poor, Oxford, mimeo.
- Heyzer, N. (1986) Working Women in South-East Asia: Development, Subordination and Emancipation, Milton Keynes, Open University Press.
- Heyzer, N. (1988) 'The Relocation of International Production and Women's Employment: the Case of Mexico', in K. Young (ed) Serving Two Masters, Delhi, Allied Publishers.
- Hirata, H. and Humphrey, J. (1991) 'Workers Response to Job Loss: Female and Male Industrial Workers in Brazil, in *World Development* 19, No. 6, 671-682.
- Honculada, J. (1985) 'Case Study: ZOTO and the twice-told story of the Philippine community organizing' *Kasarinian* 1 (2) pp 13-24.
- Hoodfar, H. (1988) 'Household budgeting and financial management in a lower-income Cairo household' in Dwyer, D. and Bruce, J. (eds) A Home Divided: Women and Income in the Third World Stanford University Press, Stanford
- Hopkins, M. (1983) 'Employment trends in developing countries. 1960-1980 and Beyond, *International Labour Review* 122 (no 4) 461-478
- Hsieh, J-C. (1982) "The Impact of Urbanization on Chinese Family Organization in Taiwan." *Bulletin of the Institute of Ethnology Academia Sinica 54*, autumn: 47-69.
- Humphrey, J. (1985) 'Gender, Pay and Skill: Manual Workers in Brazilian Industry' in Afshar, H. (ed) Women, Work and Ideology in the Third World, London, Tavistock.
- IBAM/UNICEF (1991) Mulher e Políticas Públicas, Rio de Janiero, IBAM.
- Ibrahim, B. (1982) 'Women and Factory Work in Egypt: The Intersection of Labor Demand and Household Strategies' Conference of the International Sociological Association, Canada.
- Isaacs, A. (1989) 'Crossroads; The rise and fall of a squatter movement in Cape Town, South Africa' in F. Schuurman and T. von Naerssen (eds), *Urban Social Movement in the Third World*, London, Routledge.

- ISIS (1985) 'Women and health: the Brazilian experience', ISIS International Women's Journal, No. 3.
- ISIS (1990) Violencia en contra de la mujer an America Latina y al Caribe. Informacion y politicas, Santiago, ISIS.
- IWTC (International Women's Tribune Centre)(1985) Women, Money and Credit, Newsletter 15, New York: IWTC.
- Jain, D. and Banerjee, N. (eds) (1985) Tyranny of the Household, New Delhi: Shakti.
- Jayawardena, K. (1986) Feminism and Nationalism in the Third World, London: Zed.
- Jelin, E. (1970) Migration and Labour Force Participation of Latin American Women: The Domestic Servants in the Cities' in the Wellesley Editorial Committee (ed) Women and National Development: The Complexities of Change, Chicago, University of Chicago Press.
- Jelin, E. (ed) Women and Social Change in Latin America, London, Zed.
- Jellenick, L. (1978) 'Circular migration and the pondok dwelling system: a case study of ice-cream traders in Jakarta', in P.Rimmer, D. Drakakis-Smith and T.G. McGee (eds) Food, Shelter and Transport in Southeast Asia and the Pacific, Canberra, Australian National University.
- Joekes, S. (1982) Female-led Industrialization. Women's Jobs in Third World Export Manufacturing: The Case of the Clothing Industry in Morocco, *Research Report No. 15*, Institute of Development Studies, Sussex.
- Joekes, S. (1985) "Working for lipstick? Male and Female labour in the clothing industry in Morocco' in Afshar, H (ed) Women, Work and Ideology in the Third World, London: Tavistock.
- Joekes, S. (1987) Women in the World Economy: An INSTRAW Study London Oxford University Press.
- Jolly, R. (1987) 'Women's Needs and Adjustment Policies in Developing Countries', and address to the Women's Development Group of the OECD, Paris
- Jumani, (1987) 'The Future of Home-Based Production', in Menefee Singh, A. and Kelles-Viitanen, A., *Invisible Hands*, New Delhi: Sage.

- Khbeer, N. (1991) 'Cultural Dopes or Rational Fools? Women and Labour Supply in the Bangladesh Garment Industry' European Journal of Development Research 3, no. 1: 133-160.
- Kandyoti, D. 1974. 'Some Social-Psychological Dimensions of Social Change in a Turkish Village' *The British Journal of Sociology* 25, No. 1: 47-62.
- Karl, M. (1983) 'Women and Rural Development', in Women in Development: a Resource Guide, Geneva: ISIS Collective.
- Kay, C. (1989) Latin American Theories of Development and Underdevelopment, London, Routledge.
- Keirn, S. (1975) 'Commentary on Role of African Women in Urban Environment: Case of Cameroun' *Canadian Journal of African Studies* 6, No. 2: 303-315.
- Kjellberg, Bell. (1991) 'Women, environment and urbanization: a guide to the Literature' *Environment and Urbanization*, 3, 2, 92-103
- Kneerim, J. (1989) 'Village women organize: the Mraru Kenya Bus Service', in Leonard, A. (ed) *Seeds: Supporting Women's Work in the Third World*, New York, Feminist Press.
- Kolenda, P. (1990) 'Men to Bombay, Women at Home: Urban Influence on Sugao Village, Deccan Maharashtra, India, 1942-1982' *Economic Development and Cultural Change* 38, no. 2: 446-449.
- Kumari, R.(1989) Brides Are Not For Burning, Delhi, Radiant Publishers
- Lacey, L. (1986) 'Women in the Development Process: Occupational Mobility of Female Migrants in Cities in Nigeria' *Journal of Comparative Family Studies* 17, no. 1: 1-18.
- Laclau, E. (1971) 'Feudalism and Capitalism in Latin America', New Left Review, no 67.
- Larsson, A. (1989) Women Householders and Housing Strategies: The Case of Gabarone, Botswana, Lund, The National Swedish Institute for Building Research.
- Lavinas, L. and Ribiero, L. (1992) O Genero na Estructurecaó do Espacio Urbano, Rio de Janiero, IPPUR-UFRF.

- Leon, M. (1991) 'Mujeres y espacio urbano en los programas de vivienda de interes social en Quito' in Feijoo, M.delC. and Herzer, H. (ed) *Las Mujeres y la Vida de las Ciudades*, Buenos Aires, Instituto Internacional de Medio Ambiente y Desarrollo (IIED) America Latina.
- Leonard, A. (ed) (1989) Seeds: Supporting Women's Work in the Third World, New York, The Feminist Press.
- Levy, C. (1992) 'Transport' in L. Ostergaard (ed) Gender and Development: A Practical Guide, London, Routledge.
- Lewis, O (1959) Five Families, New York, Wiley.
- Lewis, O. (1961) The Children of Sanchez, Harmondswoth, Penguin.
- Lewis, O (1966) The Culture of Poverty, Scientific American, 215:4.
- Lewis, O. (1971) La Vida.
- Lim, L. (1981) 'Women's Work in Multinational Electronics Factories' in R.Dambert and M. Cain (eds) Women and Technological Change in Developing Countries, Colorado, Boulder Press.
- £im, L. (1990) 'Women's Work in Export Factories: The Politics of a Cause' in I. Tinker (ed) *Persistent Inequalities*, New York: Oxford University Press.
- Little, K. (1965) West African Urbanization, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press.
- Little, K. (1973 African Women in Towns: An Aspect of Africa's Social Revolution Cambridge, Cambridge University Press.
- Lloyd, P. et al. (1967) The City of Ibadan, Cambridge.
- Lomnitz, L. (1977) Networks and Marginality, New York, Academic Press.
- Lycette, M. and Jaramillo, C (1984) Low-Income Housing: A Woman's Perspective, Washington D.C. International Center for Research on Women.
- Maguire, P. (1984) 'Women in development: An Alternative Analysis' (Mimeo) Amherst: M.A. Center for International Education, University of Massachusetts.
- Machado, L. (1987) The problems for women-headed households in a low-income housing programme in Brazil, in Moser, C. and Peake, L. (eds) Women, Human Settlements and Housing, London: Tavistock.

- Maher, V. (1974) 'Divorce and Property in the Middle Atlas of Morocco' Man 9, no. 1: 103-122.
- Mayer, P. (1963) Townsmen or Tribesmen, Cape Town, Oxford University Press.
- Mathey, K. (ed) (1992) Beyond Self-Help Housing, London, Mansell.
- McLeod, R. (1989) The Kingston Women's Construction Collective: building for the future in Jamaica' in Leonard, A. (ed) *Seeds: Supporting Women's Work in the Third World*, New York, Feminist Press.
- Menefee Singh, A. and Kelles-Viitanen, A., (1987) Invisible Hands, New Delhi: Sage.
- Mernissi, F. (1975) Beyond the Veil: Male-Female Dynamics in a Modern Muslim society, New York.
- Merrick, T. (1976) 'Employment and earnings in the informal sector in Brazil: the case of Belo Horizonte' Journal of Developing Areas 10, 3.
- Mitchell, J.C. (1958) 'The Kalela Dance', *Rhodes-Livingstone Papers No. 27*, Manchester University Press.
- Mitullah, W. (1991) 'Hawking as a survival strategy for the urban poor in Nairobi: the case of women.' *Environment and Urbanization* 3, No. 2: 13-22.
- Moser, C.O.N. (1977) The dual economy and the marginality debate and the contribution of micro-analysis: Market sellers in Bogota', Development and Change, 8, 465-89.
- Moser, C.O.N. (1978) Informal Sector or Petty Commodity Production: Dualism or Dependence in Urban Development?', *World Development*, Vol. 6 No. 9/10.
- Moser, C.O.N. (1981) 'Surviving in the Suburbios', *Institute of Development Studies Bulletin*, Vol. 12, No. 3.
- Moser, C. (1983) 'The Problem of Evaluating Community Participation in Urban Development Projects', in Moser C.(ed) Evaluating Community Participation in Urban Development Projects, *Development Planning Unit Working Paper* No. 14, University College: London.
- Moser, C.O.N. (1984) 'The Informal Sector Reworked: Viability and Vulnerability in Urban Development', Regional Development Dialogue, Vol. 5 No. 2.

- Moser, C. (1986) 'Women's Needs in the Urban System: Training Strategies in Gender Aware Planning' in Schmink, M., Bruce, J. and Kohn, M. (eds) Learning about Women and Urban Services in Latin America and the Caribbean, New York: The Population Council.
- Moser, C.O.N. (1987a) 'Women, Human Settlements and Housing: a Conceptual Framework for Analysis and Policy-making', in Moser, C.O.N. and Peake, L. (eds), Women, Human Settlements and Housing, London: Tavistock.
- Moser, C.O.N. (1987b) 'Mobilization is Women's Work: Struggles for Infrastructure in Guayaquil, Ecuador', in Moser, C.O.N. and Peake, L. (eds), Women, Human Settlements and Housing, London: Tavistock.
- Moser, C.O.N. (1987c) 'Are there few women leaders or is it that the majority are invisible?', unpublished paper presented at Conference on 'Local Leaders and Community Development and Participation', University of Cambridge.
- Moser, C.O.N. (1989a) 'Gender Planning in the Third World: Meeting practical and Strategic Gender Needs', World Development, vol 17, no 11.
- Moser, C.O.N. (1989b) 'Community Participation in Urban Projects in the Third World', *Progress in Planning*, vol 32, part 2.
- Moser, C.O.N. (1992) 'Adjustment From Below: Low-Income Women, Time and the Triple Role in Guayaquil, Ecuador' in Afshar, H. and Dennis, C (eds) Women and Adjustment Policies in the Third World, Basingstoke: Macmillan
- Moser, C.O.N. (1993) Gender Planning and Development: Theory, Practice and Training, London, Routledge.
- Moser, C. and Chant, S. (1986) 'The role of women in the execution of low-income housing projects training module', *DPU Gender and Planning Working Paper* no 6, London, Development Planning Unit.
- Moser, C.O.N. and Satterthwaite, D. (1985) 'The characteristics and sociology of poor urban communities', Paper prepared for a workshop on Community Health and the urban poor, Oxford, England.
- Mueller, M. (1970) 'Women and Men, Power and Powerlessness in Lesotho' in the Wellesley Editorial Committee (ed) Women and National Development: The Complexities of Change, Chicago, University of Chicago Press.

- Munachonga, M. (1988) 'Income allocation and marriage options in urban Zambia' in Dwyer, D. and Bruce, J.(eds) A Home Divided: Women and Income in the Third World Stanford University Press, Stanford.
- National Commission on Self Employed Women and Women in the Informal Sector, Shramshakti, Delhi.
- National Institute of Urban Affairs (1991) Women in the Urban Informal Sector, Delhi, NIUA.
- Nelson, N. (1978) "Women must help each other": The operation of personal networks among Buzaa beer brewers in Mathare valley, Kenya' in P. Caplan and J. Bujra (eds) Women United, Women Divided, London, Tavistock.
- Nelson, N. (1979) How women and men get by: the sexual division of labour in the informal sector of a Nairobi squatter settlement, in Bromley, R. and Gerry, C. (eds) Casual Work and Poverty in Third World Cities, London, Wiley.
- Niehaus, I. (1988) 'Domestic Dynamics and Wage Labour: A Case Study Among Urban Residents in Qwaqwa' African Studies 47, No. 2: 121-143.
- Nimpuno-Parente, P. (1987) 'The Struggle for Shelter: Women in a Site and Service Project in Nairobi, Kenya', in Moser, C.O.N. and Peake, L. (eds), Women, Human Settlements and Housing, London: Tavistock.
- Noponen, H. (1991) 'The dynamics of work and survival for the urban poor: A gender analysis of panel data from Madras.' *Development and Change* 22, No. 2: 233-260.
- Oakley, A. (1972) Sex, Gender and Society, London: Temple Smith.
- Obbo, C. (1980) African Women: Their Struggle for Economic Independence, London, Zed Press.
- Pardinas, D.L. and Dieste, C.P. (1988) in Gabayet et al (eds) *Mujeres y Sociedad:* Salario, Hogar y Acción social en el Occidiente de México, Guadelajara, el Colegio de Jalisco.
- Payne, G. (1982) Self-Help Housing: A Critique of the Gecekondus of Ankara, in Ward, P. (ed) Self-Help Housing A Critique, London, Mansell.
- Payne, G. (ed) (1984) Low-Income Housing in the Third World, London, Wiley.

- Pearce, T., Kujore, O. and Agboh-Bankole, V. (1988) 'Generating an income in the urban environment: the experience of street food venders in Ile-Ife, Nigeria.' *Africa* 58, No. 4: 385-400.
- Pearson, R. (1988) Women Workers in Mexico's Boarder Industries' in K. Young (ed) Serving Two Masters, Delhi, Allied Publishers.
- Peattie, L. (1968) The View from the Barrio, Ann Arbor, University of Michigan Press.
- Perlman, J. (1976) *The Myth of Marginality: The Urban Squatter in Brazil*, Berkeley California, University of California Press.
- Pons, V. (1969) Stanleyville, London.
- Pryer, J. and Crook, N. (1988) Cities of Hunger: Urban Malnutrition in Developing Countries, Oxford: OXFAM.
- Quijano, A (1974) 'The marginal pole of the economy and the marginalized labour force', *Economy and Society*, 3 (4).
- Raczynski, D. and Serrano, C. (1985) Vivir al Pobresa. Testimonios de Mujeres, Santiago, CIEPLAN-PISPAL.
- Raczynski, D. and Serrano, C. (eds) (1992) *Politicas Sociales, Mujeres y Gobierno Local*, Santiago, CIEPLAN.
- Rakodi, C. (1983) 'The World Bank Experience: Mass Community Participation in the Lusaka Squatter Upgrading Project', in Moser C (ed) Evaluating Community Participation in Urban Development Projects, *Development Planning Unit Working Paper* No. 14., London.
- Rakodi, C. (1988) 'Urban agriculture: research questions and Zambian evidence.' Journal of Modern African Studies 26, No. 3: 495-515.
- Ramu, G. (1989) Women, Work, and Marriage in Urban India; a Study of Dual- and Single-Earner Couples, Newbury Park, CA: Sage Publications.
- Resources for Action (1982a) Women and Shelter in Tunisia: A Survey of the Shelter Needs of Women in Low-Income Areas, Washington D.C.: USAID Office of Housing.
- Resources for Action (1982b) Women and Shelter in Honduras, Washington D.C., USAID Office of Housing.

- Roberts, B.(1978) Cities of Peasants, Edward Arnold, London.
- Roberts, B. (1967) Organizing Strangers: poor families in Guatemala City, Texas, University of Texas Press.
- Rodríguez, L (1990) Las Mujeres de Solanda, Quito, CEPAM-ILDES.
- Rogers, B. (1980) The Domestication of Women, London: Kogan Page.
- Roldan, M. (1988) Negotiating the marital contract: Intrahousehold patterns of money allocation and women's subordination among domestic outworkers in Mexico City' in Dwyer, D. and Bruce, J.(eds) A Home Divided: Women and Income in the Third World Stanford University Press, Stanford.
- Rubin, G. (1975) 'The traffic in women: notes on the "political economy" of sex ', in R.Reiter (ed), *Towards an Anthropology of Women*, 157-210, New York: Monthly Review Press.
- Rubo, A (1975) in R.Reiter (ed), *Towards an Anthropology of Women*, 157-210, New York: Monthly Review Press.
- Rudolph-Touba, J. (1973) 'Impact of Societal Institutional Changes on the Iranian Family' *International Journal of Sociology of the Family* 3, No. 1: 61-69.
- Ruland, J. (1984) 'Political change, urban services and social movements: political participation and grassroots politics in Metro Manila' *Public Administration and Development* 4, pp 325-333.
- Saffa, H. (1986) 'Female Employment in the Puerto Rican Working Class' in J. Nash and H. Saffa (eds) *Women and Change in Latin America*, Massachusetts, Bergin and Garvey.
- Saffioti, H. (1986) 'Technological Change in Brazil: Its effect on Men and Women in Two Firms' in J. Nash and H. Saffa (eds) *Women and Change in Latin America*, Massachusetts, Bergin and Garvey.
- Sandbrook, R., (198) The Politics of Basic Needs: Urban Aspects of Assaulting Poverty in Africa, London, Heinemann.
- Sanjek, R. (1976) 'New Perspectives on West African Women' *Reviews in Anthropology* 3, No. 2 (March/April) 115-134.
- Sanyal B., Valverde N. and Bamberger M.(1981) Evaluation of the First Lusaka Upgrading and Sites and Services Project, World Bank, Washington D.C.

- Sara-Lafosse, V.(1984) Comedores Comunales:La Mujer Frente A La Crisis, Lima: Servicios Urbanos y Mujeres de Bajos Ingresos.
- Sargent, L. (1981) Women and Revolution, Boston: South End Press.
- Saunders, P. (1984) Urban Politics: A Sociological Interpretation, Harmsworth, Penguin.
- Savala, M. (1981) 'Organizing the Annapurna', *Institute of Development Studies Bulletin*, 12, July.
- Schlyter, A. (1988) Women Householders and Housing Strategies: The Case of George, Lund, The National Swedish Institute for Building Research.
- Schlyter, A. (1989) Women Householders and Housing Strategies: The Case of Harare, Zimbabwe, Lund, The National Swedish Institute for Building Research.
- Schmink, M. (1982) 'Women in the Urban Economy in Latin America, *Population Council Working Paper* No. 1, New York: The Population Council.
- Schmink, M. (1984) 'The Working Group Approach to Women and Urban Services', mimeo, Gainsville: Centre for Latin American Studies, University of Florida.
- Schmink, M. 1984) Community Management of Waste Recycling; The Sirdo, New York, Population Council.
- Schmink, M. (1989) 'Community Management of Waste Recycling in Mexico: The SIRDO' in Leonard, A. (ed), Seeds: Supporting Women's Work in the Third World, New York: The Feminist Press.
- Schmink, M. (1989) 'Community Management of Waste Recycling in Mexico: The SIRDO' in Leonard, A. (ed), Seeds: Supporting Women's Work in the Third World, New York: The Feminist Press.
- Schmink, M., Bruce, J. and Kohn, M. (eds) (1986) Learning about Women and Urban Services in Latin America and the Caribbean, New York: The Population Council.
- Schmitz, H. (1979) 'Factory and Domestic Employment in Brazil: A Study of the Hamock Industry and its Implications for Employment Theory and Practice', IDS Discussion Paper no 146, Brighton: Institute of Development Studies.
- Schmitz, H. (1982) 'Growth Constraints on Small-Scale Manufacturing in Developing Countries: A Critical Review', World Development, Vol 10, No. 6.

- Schuster, I (1979) New Women of Lusaka, California, Mayfield Press.
- Scott, A.M. (1981) Job Differentiation and Mobility among Married Workers in Lima, Peru (mimeo).
- Scott, A.M. (1986a) 'Women and Industrialization: Examining the 'Female Marginalization' Thesis, in *Journal of Development Studies*, 22:4, 649-80.
- Scott, A.M. (1986b) 'Industrialization, gender segregation and stratification theory' in R. Crompton and M.Mann, (eds) *Gender and Stratification*, Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Scott, A.M. 'Informal Sector or Female Sector?: Gender Bias in Urban Labour Market Models' in Elson, D. (ed) *Male Bias in the Development Process* Manchester, Manchester University Press.
- Selby, H. (1991) 'The Oaxacan urban household and the crisis.' *Urban Anthropology* 20, No. 1, 87-98.
- Sen, A. (1990) 'Gender and Co-operative Conflicts' in Tinker, I. (ed) *Persistent Inequalities*, Oxford: Oxford University Press
- Sen, G. and L. Grown. (1987). Development, Crises, and Alternative Visions: Third World Perspectives. New York: Monthly Review Press.
- Sethuraman, S.V. (ed) (1981) The Urban Informal Sector in Developing Countries: Employment, Poverty and Environment (a WEP Study) Geneva, ILO.
- Shah, N. (1986) Basic Needs, Women and Development: Survey of Squatters in Lahore, Pakistan. Ottawa: IDRC/ Honolulu: East-West Population Institute.
- Shantha Mohan, N. (1989) Returns from Education to Employed Women in India; a Study of Bangalore City, New Delhi The Uppal Publishing House.
- Sharma, U. (1986) Women's Work, Class and the Urban Household, London, Tavistock
- Shields, N. (1980) 'Women in the Urban Labour Markets of Africa: The Case of Tanzania' World Bank Staff Working Paper no. 380. Washington, DC: World Bank.
- Shiva, V. (1988) Staying Alive, London, Zed.

- Sibisi, H. (1970) 'How African Women Cope with Migrant Labour in South Africa' in the Wellesley Editorial Committee (ed) Women and National Development: The Complexities of Change, Chicago, University of Chicago Press.
- Silas, J.(1984) 'The Kampung Improvement Programme of Indonesia: A Comparative Case Study of Jakarta and Surabaya' in Payne G.(ed), op cit.
- Silva, J and Schuurman, F. (1989) 'Neighbourhood associations in Buenos Aires: contradictions within contradictions' in F. Schuurman and T. von Naerssen (eds), Urban Social Movement in the Third World, London, Routledge.
- Singh, A. (1980) Women in Cities: an Invisible Factor in Urban Planning in India, New York, Population Council mimeo.
- Skinner, R.(1983a) 'A Peruvian Popular Participation Policy and Experience in Sites and Services: Villa El Salvador, Lima', in Moser. C (ed) (1983) op cit.
- Skinner, R.(1983b) 'Community Participation: Its Scope and Organization', in Skinner R. and Rodell M., *People, Poverty and Shelter*, Methuen.
- Slater, D. (ed)(1985) New Social Movements and the State in Latin America, Amsterdam, CEDLA.
- Smith, M. (1973) 'Domestic Service as a Channel of upward Mobility for the Lower-Class woman: The Lima Case, in Pescatello, A. (ed) *Female and Male in Latin America: Essays*, Pittsburgh, University of Pittsburgh Press.
- Sontheimer, S. (ed) Women and the Environment: A Reader, London, Earthscan.
- Sood, S (ed) (1990) Violence Against Women, Jaipur, Arihant Publishers
- Sorock, M., Dicker, H., Giraldo, A. and Waltz, S. (1984) Women and Shelter, Washington DC USAID Office of Housing.
- Standing, G. (1976) 'Female Labour Supply in an Urbanizing Economy' Working Paper on Population and Employment no. 44. Geneva: ILO.
- Standing, H. (1991) Dependence and Autonomy: Women's Employment and the Family in Calcutta, London, Routledge.
- Stewart, F.(1985) Planning to Meet Basic Needs, London Macmillan.

- Stewart, F. (1992) Can adjustment programmes incorporate the interest of women?' in Afshar, H. and Dennis, C. (eds) *Women and Adjustment Policies in the Third World*, Basingstoke: Macmillan.
- Stichter, S. (1985) 'The Middle Class Family in Kenya: Changes in Gender Relations.' African Urban Studies 2: 39-52.
- Streeton, P., Burki, S., Haq, M. Hicks, N., Stewart, F. (1981) First Things First:

 Meeting Basic Human Needs in Developing Countries, New York, Oxford University Press, 1981.
- Sudarkasa, N. (1970) 'Women and Migration in Contemporary West Africa' in the Wellesley Editorial Committee (ed) *Women and National Development: The Complexities of Change*, Chicago, University of Chicago Press.
- Tinker, I. (1982) *Gender Equity in Development: A Policy Perspective*, Washington D.C: Equity Policy Center.
- Tinker, I. (1987) 'Street foods: testing assumptions about informal sector activity by women and men.' *Current Sociology* 35, No. 3.
- Tripp, A. (19890 'Women and the changing urban household economy in Tanzania.' *Journal of Modern African Studies* 27, No. 4, 601-623.
- Turner, J. (1970) Barriers and channels for housing developments in modernizing cities, in Mangin, W. (ed) *Peasants in Cities*, Boston, Houghton Miffin.
- Turner, J. (1976) Housing by People: Towards Autonomy in Building Environments, Marion Boyers, London.
- United Nations. (1990) Methods of Measuring Women's Participation and Production in the Informal Sector. No. E. 90. XVII. 16. New York: United Nations.
- Vaal, M., S. Findley and A. Diallo. (1989) 'The gift economy: a study of women migrants' survival strategies in a low-income Bamako neighborhood.' *Labour, Capital and Society* 22, No. 2, 234-260.
- Valaderes, L. (1978) Working the system: squatter response to resettlement in Rio de Janiero, *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research*, 2, 1, 12-25.
- Vance, I. (1987) 'More than Bricks and Mortar: Women's Participation in Self-Help Housing in Managua, Nicaragua' in Moser, C.O.N. and Peake, L. (eds), Women, Human Settlements and Housing, London: Tavistock.

- van der Linden (1989) 'The limits of territorial social movements: the case of housing in Karachi' in F. Schuurman and T. von Naerssen (eds), *Urban Social Movement in the Third World*, London, Routledge.
- Volbeda, S. (1989) 'Housing and survival strategies of women in metropolitan slum areas in Brazil.' *Habitat International* 13, No. 3, 157-171.
- Wachtel, E. (1975) "Minding Her Own Business: Economic Enterprises of Women in Nakuru, Kenya." Canadian Association of African Studies, 5th Annual Conference, 19-22 February, Toronto, Ontario.
- Wade, R. (19?).
- Waltz, S. E. 1985. "Women's Housing Needs in the Arab Cultural Context of Tunisia." *Ekistics* 52, no. 310: 28-34.
- Ward, P. (ed) (1982) Self-Help Housing A Critique, London, Mansell.
- Weeda, M. (1987) 'The role of social planning and participation in the refugee context; A question of integration or marginalization?', M.Sc. in Social Planning in Developing Countries Dissertation, London School of Economics.
- West, G. and Blumberg, R. (eds) Women and Social Protest, New York, Oxford University Press.
- White, L (1983) 'A history of prostitution on Nairobi, Kenya 1990-1952', unpublished Ph.D. thesis, University of Cambridge.
- White, L. (1984) 'Women in the changing African family' in M. Hay and S. Stichter (eds) African Women South of the Sahara, London, Longman.
- Wikan, U. (1976) Life Among the Poor in Cairo, London, Tavistock.
- Wisner, B. (1988) *Power and Need in Africa: Basic Needs and Development Policies*, London, Earthscan Publications, 1988.
- Wolf, M. (1985) Revolution Postponed: Women in Contemporary China Stanford, Stanford University Press.
- World Development. (1989) Special Issue 'Beyond Survival: Expanding Income-Earning Opportunities for Women in Developing Countries', *World Development* vol 17, No. 7.

- World Bank, Urban Policy and Economic Development: An Agenda for the 1990s, Washington D.C., World Bank.
- Yoon, S-Y. (1985) 'Women and Collective Self-Reliance: South Korea's New Community Movement' in Muntemba, S. (ed) *Rural Development and Women: Lessons from the Field*, Geneva, ILO/DANIDA.
- Ziccardi, A. (1977) Politicas de vivienda y movimientos urbanos. El caso de Buenos Aires (1963-73), Buenos Aires, CEUR.